

Cost Effectiveness of Teachers Working at Government and Private Colleges

Muhammad Tahir Khan Farooqi* Hafiz Muhammad Ather Khan† Ghulam Qambar‡



Abstract

The paper analyses cost and effectiveness of academic staff working at government and private colleges district Bahawalpur. Therein, it focuses, (a) comparison of cost between private and Government Colleges, (b) finding the sector which readily adopts new trends in education through cost-effectiveness, (c) evaluates the use of resources in government and private college in terms of quality efficacy, and (d) compare the achievement in education in government and private sector by utilizing cost-effectiveness analysis. Survey approach was used for data collection. So, two separate questionnaires were developed on a five point Likert scale. Cost and effectiveness in government and private college were then reviewed. The sample was selected from the universe of teachers and Parents of Bahawalpur district. Data were then analysed and presented through means and t-test. Major findings of the study indicated government college teachers' salary fall between 50,000 to 100,000 and private college salary 20,000 to 50,000. Majority of teachers in both sectors teach undergraduate and graduate level classes. Very few teachers teach higher level classes. Government college teachers show more flexibility in their behaviour as claimed by respondents, than their private counterparts. Private college did superior work in the category of ethic than Government College. It is observed that private college teachers encourage the students learning by doing in the classroom more than Government College.

Key Words:

Government,
Private,
College, Cost
Effectiveness,
College
Teachers

Introduction

Cost effectiveness is one of the simple economic techniques to assess the outcomes. It is commonly used producing good quality result. The amount of funds spent when and whether to make changes at educational institution for getting

*Assistant Professor, Department of Educational Research and Assessment, University of Okara, Okara, Punjab, Pakistan.

†Assistant Professor, Department of Educational Training, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Bahawalpur, Punjab, Pakistan. Email: hafizather@gmail.com

‡PhD Scholar(Education), Department of Educational Research and Assessment, University of Okara, Okara, Pakistan, Pakistan.

desired results. This study describes the costs spend on academic staff working at government and private college and checks the effectiveness or outcomes at government and private education in Pakistan. This study also identifies those factors that influence the costs and effectiveness at both sectors. It is also estimate levels of study subsidies. The methods of cost effectiveness help the researcher to evaluate the educational programs. Cost effectiveness analysis is designed to assist in choosing alternative results as resources are limited. Most educational decisions face constraints in the availability of resource (Usman, Akbar, & Ramzan, 2013).

According to Admine, (2013), this study describe that Educational system is made up of both private and government sector starting from basic level up to higher education level. In Pakistan private sector of education is impart up to date quality of education and on the other hand government sector offer free cost of education at school level and cost of studies at the higher-education -level, is very low as compared to private sector education. Most of parents send their children in private institution because it imparts a progressive and up to date education with great efficiency. As the results students step out very confident and bold. The private institution does not waste talent of students. It pays full attention and polishes all his abilities. The staff of private institution is not well qualified with respect to government's college teachers, and they are less skilled; yet children get full attention and care as compared government institution. The well-educated staff can develop well educated and well-mannered students in the institution. For the progress of the nation English is the essential element. Private sector is doing a perfect job. At the end students learn English language skills and latest and most modern studies in institution. The qualification of the parents is also determinants in the selection appropriate sector.

In education sector Private colleges compete with government colleges. The numbers of student are in both sectors in Pakistan. The study aimed at comparing the cost effectiveness of education at government and private colleges district Bahawalpur. As well known the successful education system need the high quality and qualified teachers. The roll of teachers is very much significant as employ of institutions at both sectors. The teacher has most effective teaching and knowledge skill. It enables the students to use their abilities, develop the shining future especially in practical and professional life. Cost is the value of money that has been spent on teachers to produce good results. The cost effectiveness analysis compares the cost and outcomes of teacher's services at government and private sector which provide the knowledge about system (Niazi & Mace, 2006).

At private college the class size is appropriate. The institution develops the proper plan and implements it. It spends money and expenditure to achieve the desired goals of students' achievements. Spent money and expenditure for any organization, programme and institution is cost. Cost effectiveness analyses in education programs encounters with the challenge of monitoring. The ratio can be

measured and compared at educational and non-educational program outcomes. Education plays a fundamental role in human resources development. The estimation of cost and effectiveness raises the output and efficiency of individual and whole students at government and private sector both. It produces skill of people that are expert of leading the economy. Adam Smith argued that the performance of institutions of education is influenced by the sources of their working and outcomes or benefits and returns. Economists and government policy makers discuss the qualities of private and government teachers' performance at educational institution.

This research examined the relationship between the teaching performance of both institutions of education and sources of funds. Performance of the teachers in government and private sector can be compared (Suleman, Aslam, Habib, Gillani, & Hussain, 2011). It suggests that student achievement may be improved through high quality performing teachers. Cost effectiveness is an assessment tool which we review the benefits of any value or cost. Cost effectiveness is mostly used to policy maker in management of program or educational institution at government and private sector. Researchers analyzed the benefits of facilities which are provided at government and private sector. The also analyzed the cost spent on academic staff working at government and private sector those teachers giving the benefits to their college in both sectors. Their study focused investigation of cost effectiveness of public and private colleges.

Delimitation of the Study

The study was delimited to staff working at Government and private colleges in Bahawalpur District. The total Government and private Colleges and parents of the students in Bahawalpur District were include in the population of this study.

Review of the Literature

Cost is an amount and charge paid in payment for buying something. Cost is the value of money that has been used up to produce anything and consequently is not available for use anymore. Cost is the input that is spent in order to obtain the thing such as people spend money on education to get benefit or profit in the shape of knowledge and skills of human beings. This attainment cost may be the sum of the cost of construction as incurred by the innovative manufacturer. The further costs of deal as incurred by the acquirer over and more than the price remunerated to the producer. Commonly, the cost also includes a gain for return above the cost of production. Cost is spending of something such as time, labor, expenditure of building, material provided in class, teacher's salary, teachers spending on them, spending on their transport, computer lab and internet facility, facility of

dispensary in college and some valuable thing. It is necessary for the attainment of the desired goal (Carnoy & Levin, 1995).

Cost is a value or money that is invested in any educational program and organization. In educational program cost is building, expenditure of college, salary of teachers, transport and dressing which spending during duty hours, computer lab and internet and college dispensary all thing that invest any to get outcomes is cost. Cost is spending of something such as time, labor, expenditure of building, material provide in class, teachers salary, teachers spending on them, spending on their transport, computer lab and internet facility, facility of dispensary in college and some valuable thing. It is necessary for the attainment of the desired goal (Carpenter & Haggart, 2003).

Effectiveness is outcomes of any educational program and institution or organization. Effectiveness is producing good result for the amount of money spent economically. Effectiveness is the degree to which educational objectives are achieved and the levels of the [problems](#) are solved at both sector. Effectiveness is an ability of producing desired results such as qualified and committed teachers. It is also includes student's achievement in study, teachers regularity, command on their subject question answer session, teacher student interaction increase and the learning outcomes of the students.

Effectiveness is producing good result for the amount of money spent economically. Effectiveness is the degree to which educational objectives are achieved and the levels of the [problems](#) are solved at both sector. Effectiveness is an ability of producing desired results such as qualified and committed teachers. It is also includes, student's achievement in study, teachers regularity, command on their subject question answer session, teacher student interaction increase and the learning outcomes of the students. Cost effectiveness is a tool of decision making. It describes the most resourceful way to accomplish their objectives in evaluation of any educational program. This tool can be used to discuss the economic efficiency of a program. Method of cost effectiveness gives the support to the researcher in evaluating the educational programs (Carnoy & Levin, 1995).

In educational sector cost is an amount of money which spent to improve the conditions of the institution such as teachers' salaries, teachers spending amount on themselves, transports, college building, building rent, expenditure in classroom, computer lab and internet facility, dispensary, valuable things used in educational institution at both sector. All things that need to run an institution is cost. Effectiveness is the outcome of educational sector that all things which provide in college have effective impact on student learning. Teacher's performance, building, computer lab and internet, alternate of electricity, environment of the college contribute towards the enhancement in the learning study. This describes the comparison of cost and effectiveness of academic staff working at both sectors. For this study a Cost effectiveness tool to check the economic expenditure of academic staff at government sector was used and the

same way it was used for private sector. Comparing the student learning at government and private college requires evidence. It is perceived that in private sector teachers get low salaries and performed well at their institute. While at government sector teachers have desired pay from government, but student performance is satisfactory. The reason may be class sizes in Government College are too much large. At private college the class sizes is appropriate. The institution develops the proper plan and implements it. It spends money and expenditure to achieve the desired goals of students' achievements. Spent money and expenditure for any organization, programme and institution is cost.

Cost effectiveness is a tool of decision making. It describes the most resourceful way to accomplish their objectives in evaluation of any educational program. This tool can be used to discuss the economic efficiency of a program. Method of cost effectiveness gives the support to the researcher in evaluating the educational programs. Cost effectiveness is one of the simple economic techniques to assess the outcomes. It is commonly used producing good quality result. The amount of funds spent when and whether to make changes at educational institution for getting desired results. This study describes the costs spend on academic staff working at government and private college and checks the effectiveness or outcomes at government and private education in Pakistan. This study also identifies those factors that influence the costs and effectiveness at both sectors. It is also estimate levels of study subsidies. The methods of cost effectiveness help the researcher to evaluate the educational programs. Cost effectiveness analysis is designed to assist in choosing alternative results as resources are limited. Most educational decisions face constraints in the availability of resources (Barnett, 1996).

In education sector Private colleges are competing with government colleges. The numbers of student are in both sectors in Pakistan. The study aimed at comparing the cost effectiveness of education at government and private colleges district Bahawalpur. As well known the successful education system need the high quality and qualified teachers. The roll of teachers is very much significant as employ of institutions at both sectors. The teacher has most effective teaching and knowledge skill. It enables the students to use their abilities, develop the shining future especially in practical and professional life. Cost is the value of money that has been spent on teachers to produce good results. The cost effectiveness analysis is systematically used to compare the cost and outcomes of teacher's services at government and private sector which provide the knowledge about system (Henry, 1988).

Research expresses the importance of cost effectiveness in policy making and implementing the policies in educational sector by using cost effectiveness. Cost effectiveness becomes the reason to promote education government sector, private sector, health, environment, agriculture, finance, and governance (Dhaliwal, Duflo, Glennerster, & Tulloch, 2012).

It involves the programs, resources, requirements and all aspects of project means effectiveness projected for each program and for alternative future environments (Carpenter & Haggart, 2003). The effectiveness with respect to cost is more in private sector and outcome becomes good according to utilization in private sector of education in western countries (McEwan, 2012).

The analysis of unit costs mainly in terms of per student indicate the areas and level of changes that are required to be affected keeping especially in view the changes in other inter related parameters relating to the promotion of education and its linkages with other socio-economic sectors. Cost analysis is thus used by the educational planners to improve internal as well as external efficiency of programmers' by introducing suitable changes in the structure of input costs of different programmers and institutions. It may be emphasized that cost analysis is useful when the unit costs are compared with other alternative mode of delivery of services and that in relation to some measure of outcome and mainly in terms of learning attainments. There has been no worthwhile attempt to estimate the costs of education programmed offered by a cross section of college under the aegis of the central and the state Governments. It is not known as to why and to what extent input costs vary (Tiwari, 2013).

In education sector Private colleges are competing with government colleges. The education increases the both sectors in Pakistan. The study aimed at comparing the quality of education at government and private colleges district Bahawalpur. As well known the successful education system need the high quality and qualified teachers. The roll of teachers is very much significant as employ of institutions at both sectors. The teacher has most effective teaching and knowledge skill. It is enable the student to use their abilities develop the shining future especially in practical and professional life. A cost is the values of money that has been used to teachers for produce good results of the student outcomes. The cost effectiveness analyses are systematically used to compare the cost and outcomes of teacher's services at government and private sector which provide the best learning for the students (Henry, 1988).

Research Methodology

The study compared the cost effectiveness of academic staff working in government and private colleges. Therefore, various aspects of competencies of academic staff were measured. Cost was calculated trough expenditures on staff development, salaries, rent for buildings, and different utility bills etc. Effectiveness of academic staff working in government/ private colleges were calculated through; results, behaviors, helpfulness, training, and personality development of students. In order to assess the professional competencies of government and private academic staff of district Bahawalpur a research tool was developed. Keeping in view the objectives of the study, a questionnaire was

developed, administered and data collected through this questionnaire was analyzed with the help of SPSS version 17.

Population

The population of the study consisted of all male and female academic staff working in government and private colleges. The study was survey type and census sampling method was done for selection of colleges and all available teachers were requested to provide data. Out 31 principals 29 principals agreed to provide data. It means 93.55% of principals provided data for this study. Sample was taken from the district of Bahawalpur. The population included male and female teachers both at government and private colleges and parents of the students. To conduct the survey, sample of 290 teachers and 200 parents were taken from district Bahawalpur.

Sampling

A representative sample was taken as follows:

Sample 1: Twenty-nine (29) principal at the Government and private colleges male and female both urban and rural locality of the district Bahawalpur.

Sample 2: Two Hundred and sixty-one (261) teachers at the Government and private colleges were selected randomly from each college of the district Bahawalpur include male and female, urban and rural locality of the district Bahawalpur.

Sample 3: Two Hundred parents of the students from Government and private colleges.

Data was collected through questionnaire. The questionnaires were delivered personally to the principals, teachers and parents of the students who were studying in these colleges for getting views about the comparative study of cost effectiveness of academic staff working at government and private colleges. Total 490 persons responded to questionnaires.

Findings and Conclusions

From the data we conclude that college teachers spend sufficient time in college and teaching their classes. College teachers' salary is sufficient enough for the fulfillment of their basic needs. It may be considered as good but there is a huge difference in salaries of government and private sectors' teachers. Government sector's teachers receive a handsome salary, but private college teachers have very low income as compared to other fields of life in Pakistan. We also conclude that

majority of teachers teach under graduate and graduate students. Very few teachers teach higher level classes and B.S classes.

Majority of teachers had additional source of income other than their salary. Very few teachers did not have additional source of income other than their salaries. It is concluded that college building of Government is mostly of medium and large size and private college building is small and medium size both. According to the perception of the teachers Government colleges' budget is between 50,000 to 300,000 and private college budget is 10,000 50,000 per month. Respondents perceive that Government colleges' environment is very good and Private college environment is good for the students. We conclude that Government college teacher's average contract hours per day are between 1 to 7 while Private college teacher's hours per day are between 1 and 8.

It is concluded that Government college teachers daily instructional hours per day are between 2 hours to 7 hours and Private college teachers daily instructional hours per day are more than 7 hours. It is also concluded that Government college teachers got scholarships during 2500 to 5000 and Private college teachers got scholarship during their studies 3500 to 5000. It is showed that Government college teachers spend 5000 to 15,000 rupees per month on themselves while Private college teachers spend as much as 5000.

Researcher concluded that 90% of Government and private college teachers both spend break time in taking tea and refreshment. Most of Government Colleges have 11 to 14 computers in their labs while Private Colleges have 10 to 12 computers in labs. Internet facility is available in Government College and number of computers in lab equipped with internet, are 10 to 12 while in private college internet facility is provided 8 to 12 computers. Researcher concluded that both government and private colleges have 90% alternate of electricity supply for computer lab is providing. Respondent perceive that government college teacher student ratio is between 1: 40 to 1: 75 and Private college teacher student ratio is between 1:30 to 1:40. It is concluded that dispensary is available in 90% of both government and private colleges.

It is also concluded that in Government College, 2,000 to more than 5,000 students are studying while in private colleges, 1500 to 2000 students are studying. It is perceived that in Government College, number of classroom is between 15 to more than 20 while in private college classroom is between 8 and 12. We conclude that on A.V aids, 200 to 500 Rupees are spent in government colleges while private colleges spend 200 to 400 on A.V aids per month. It is concluded that the respondents agreed that government college teachers have innovative thinking much more than private college teacher.

According to the perception of the teachers that government college teachers have positive behaviors towards their student's more than private college teachers. We conclude that government college teachers show more flexibility in their behavior, as claimed by respondents, than their private counterparts. Respondents

perceive that Private college rules and behavior expectation are clearly stated are understood between everyone in the class more than the Government College.

The study finds that government college teachers encouraging students' elaboration using challenging instructional material in the classroom more than private college. It is concluded that government college students enhanced to discipline more than private college. It is showed that private college has superior work for ethic than Government College. We conclude that government college teachers caring for individual pupil's more than private college. Respondents perceive that teachers and students' interaction in government colleges better than the private college. It is concluded that government college teachers engage their students in educational activities in the classroom more than private college teachers.

It is also found that government college teachers engage their students in educational activities in the classroom more than private college teachers. We observe that government college teachers use simulation to foster learning of the student's more than private college. It is observed that private college teachers encourage the students learning by doing in the classroom more than Government College. Researcher concluded that respondents think government college faculty understands the benefits and limitations of teacher's effectiveness more than private college teachers.

It is established that in government colleges poor quality of teaching is accepted but it is not acceptable in private college. It is showed that contradictory to the above statement over all standard of teaching in private college is low than the government college. It is concluded that private college teachers try to get meaningful feedback from class more than government college teachers. Respondents claim that private college teachers have a clear set of learning objectives of their students in the classroom. Researcher concluded that government college teachers are clearer about their educational goals in the classroom than private college teachers.

Data analysis showed that private college teachers relate the subject matter with lives of the students more than government college teachers. Respondents claim that government college teachers establish healthy relationship with parents of the students' more than private college teachers. Respondent perceive that government college teachers perform their duty regularly and punctually more than private college teachers.

Researcher found that private college teachers give immediate feedback to the students with criticism more than government college teachers. It is seen that government college teachers provide opportunity to students to increase participation through asking questions more than private college teachers. It has been observed that private college teachers are motivated more than the government college teachers. Respondent perceive that private college teachers have stronger commitment to teaching more than the government college teachers.

Government college teachers give proper feedback to the students. It is concluded that Private college teachers provide opportunity to students to increase participation through asking questions more than government college teachers. It has been observed that government college teachers give individual attention to every student more than private college.

Discussions

The present study concludes the cost effectiveness of academic staff working at government and private colleges. It was found that this analysis is important in decision making and implementing the policies. Before this study another study was conducted in health department. Many of the results are similar to that study. Cost is money spent on an educational program or institution or organization. Effectiveness is the measure of outcomes after spending money on any program/institution or organization. This study also verified the results of cost effectiveness of open and distance learning system in Pakistan.

This study examined the cost and effectiveness of academic staff working in both government and private colleges by using the questionnaire for teachers and parents of the students. Teachers spend sufficient time in college and teaching their classes. There is a huge difference in salaries of government and private sectors' teachers. Government sector teachers receive a handsome salary, but private college teachers have very low income. Majority of teachers teach undergraduate and graduate classes. Majority of teachers had additional source of income other than their salaries and very few teachers did not have additional source. The college building of government is mostly medium and large size and private college building small and medium size both.

According to the perception of the teacher's government colleges' budget is 300,000 and private colleges' budget is 50,000 per month. It is perceived that government colleges' environment is very good and private college environment is good for the students. The study showed that government and private sector both have computer lab and internet facility and both government and private sector have 90 % alternate of electricity supply for computer lab is providing. Dispensary available in both government and private sector.

Government college teachers have positive behaviors and innovative thinking towards their students more than private college teachers. The government college teachers encouraging students 'elaboration and enhanced to discipline.' The private college teachers encourage the students learning by doing in the classroom. Government and private college teachers perform their duty regularly and punctually. Both government and private college teachers provide opportunity to students to increase participation through asking questions.

Recommendations

It is recommended that teachers should be made more dutiful and punctual in both government and private sector. Their salaries package should be according to their services. Both government and private college should be taught about ethic and discipline as a subject. At the government sector there should be more check and balance and be given salaries according to their education. At the government sector, new staff should be introduced according to the curriculum. Physically unfit teachers should be retired. In private sector social sciences subjects, should also be given equal importance as natural sciences is given. More government colleges may be opened as they are more cost effective than private colleges in Pakistan.

References

- Dhaliwal, I., Duflo, E., Glennerster, R., & Tulloch, C. (2012, December 3). Comparative Cost Effectiveness Analysis to Inform Policy Developing Countries. *A General Framework with Application for Education* .
- McEwan, P. J. (2012). Cost-effectiveness analysis of education and health interventions in Developing Countries. *Journal of Development Effectiveness* , 4 (2), 189-213.
- Carpenter, M., & Haggart, A. S. (2003). Cost Effectiveness Analysis for Educational Planing. In M. B. A.Haggart, & D. L.Roberts (Ed.), *Planning Urban Education* (pp. 169-180). California: The Rand Corporation.
- Tsang, M. C., Levin, & McEwan, P. (2002). *Comparing the Cost of Public and Private Schools in Developing Countries*. Thailand: American Education Finance Association.
- Levin, H. M. & McEwan, P. (2001). Cost-Effectiveness Analysis: Methods and Applications. *Cost-Effectiveness and Cost-Benefit Analysis* .
- Admine. (2013). Why parents in pakistan prefer private schools for their children. *Study aims*.
- Henry, M. L. (1988). Cost-Effectiveness and Educational Policy. *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis* , 10 (1), 51-69.
- Barnett, W. (1996). *Lives in the Balance*. Ypsilanti: High/Scope Press.
- Tiwari, S. D. (2013). Cost Analysis of Higher Education. *International Journal on Recent and Innovation Trends in Computing and Communication* , 1 (5), 414-423.
- Carnoy, M., & Levin, H. M. (1995). Cost- effectiveness Analysis. *International Encyclopedia of Economics of Education*, 2, 381-386.
- Latif, K., Shahid, M. N., Sohail, D. N., & Shahbaz, M. (2011, December). Job satisfaction among public and private college teachers of district Faisalabad, Pakistan. *Interdisciplinary Journal of Contemporary research in bussiness*, 3(8), 235.
- Niazi, H. K., & Mace, J. (2006, December). The contribution of the private sector to higher education in pakistan with particular reference to efficiency and equity. *Bulletin of Education & Research*, 28(2), 17-42.

Suleman, Q., Aslam, D. H., Habib, M. B., Gillani, U. A., & Hussain, D. I. (2011, November). Effectiveness of the Teacher Training Programmes. *International Journal of Humanities and social sciences*, 1(16).

Usman, S., Akbar, M. T., & Ramzan, M. (2013, sep-Oct). Effect of salary and stress on job satisfaction of Teacher in District sialkot, Pakistan. *Journal of Humanities and social science*, 15(2), 68-74.