

Ujala Siddiq \*

Zargham Ullah Khan †

Umm e Aiman‡



## The Critical Impact of Better Civil Services Reforms on the Better Governance of the Country: A Study of Pakistan

### Abstract

*A long history of poor management, rampant corruption, and politicization of civil service has left Pakistan in an economic quagmire, inequitable growth, and political instability. Pakistan's civil service, by all parameters, has failed to provide effective service delivery and other basic services of public welfare. In the public eye, the country's civil service officers are seen as non-compliant and least responsive, and uncompassionate behavior coupled with bureaucratic hurdles further aggravate the exploitation of the common masses. The lack of transparency and the military's ability to interfere in the public domain have raised concerns about the state's ability to maintain order. The government should prioritize reforms to transform the Armed Forces into a more effective and efficient organization. Since its inception in 1947, Pakistan has made many attempts to reform civil services, but no real change on the ground calls for turning the elusive dream of civil service delivery into reality. If the flaws of an unreformed bureaucracy remain unaddressed, the government may risk its chances of gaining public support.*

**Key Words:** Services, Civil, Public, Government

### Introduction

In any democracy, the ministers or political executives are responsible for formulating the country's administrative policies. The civil servants are the ones who implement those policies and procedures. Through an open competitive examination, candidates are selected for the civil service positions most likely to excel in the job. Pakistan's public service commission, known as the FPSC, is the authority that oversees the selection of the country's civil servants. This process is based on the Indian Civil Service. In Pakistan, the authority to make decisions lies with the people, who are the main source of power. On the other hand, civil service is considered the key component of a state's operation, which is responsible for moving the country's various departments and agencies.

The civil service helps the elected representatives carry out their duties and implement policies that are beneficial to the

common masses. Unfortunately, Pakistan's civil service has been plagued by various issues, such as poor management and corruption. This has resulted in the country's instability and economic decline. The country's civil servants are often regarded as incompetent and uncompassionate, which has raised concerns about their ability to effectively address modern-day issues. This issue has allowed the military to intervene in the country's operations. Despite numerous attempts to improve the country's civil service, the implementation of reforms has not been successful. This could threaten the government's chances of winning the public's support.

### Background of Civil Services Reform

After becoming an independent nation on August 14, 1947, Pakistan's civil service became the main institution that serves the country. This

\* VF Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad, Pakistan/Ph.D. Scholar, UMT, University of Malaysia.

Email: [Ujala.emails@gmail.com](mailto:Ujala.emails@gmail.com)

† Hailey College of Banking and Finance, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan.

‡ Masters In Public Administration, Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad, Pakistan.

structure is the successor of the Indian Civil Service. The British East India Company was one of the major companies operating in India. During its operation, the company had two categories of employees. These divisions were then abolished following the Atchison Commission's recommendations. The new structure would be called the Imperial Civil Service of India.

In 1912, a class difference was established to distinguish the different levels of civil servants in different services. For instance, those working in the executive branch were classified as class 1st officers while those in the operational division were classified as class 2nd officers. After the partition of India, the Indian civil service was redesignated as the Pakistan Administration Services and the Civil Services of Pakistan. During the time of the partition, only 82 civil servants were working in Pakistan, which was less than the number needed to meet the country's administrative needs. During the partition, Pakistan maintained the existing structure of the civil service in India. Two categories of services were also maintained. The country's civil service is composed of 13 central services. These include the police and the Civil Services of Pakistan.

- I. Pakistan Foreign Service PFS.
- II. Account Service.
- III. Pakistan Customs and Excise Service.
- IV. Pakistan Taxation Service.
- V. Pakistan Military Land and Cantonment Service.
- VI. Pakistan Postal Service.
- VII. Telegraph Engineering Service.
- VIII. Central Engineering Service.
- IX. Information Services of Pakistan.
- X. Central Secretariat Service.
- XI. General Administrative Service.
- XII. Economic Pool.

## Research Questions

1. What is the evaluation of the history of civil services reform?
2. Why Civil services reforms are imperative for effective service delivery, transparent

government, and equitable socio-economic growth of the general masses?

## Research Objectives

1. To review the history of civil services reforms
2. To observe the impact of civil services reforms on effective service delivery and transparent government
3. To analyze the impact of the better civil services reforms on the equitable socio-economic growth of the general masses

## Literature Review

### Justice Munir Ahmed's Report

In 1949, Mr. Justice Munir Ahmed was appointed as chairman of the report on standard remuneration. He gave the following points:

- I. As much remuneration is awarded to civil servants that would be enough to maintain their status quo of life.
- II. He rejected the quasi-socialist standard of remuneration.
- III. He suggested that the skilful and intellectual civil servant should prefer the private enterprise rather than the public because of a mismatch in skill, duties, and remuneration.

### Mr. Jaffrie's Report in 1952

Mr. Jaffrie, from the US treasury, was appointed to report on the development of organization and methods working in the Pakistan government.

At his suggestion, the Management Service Division was established. The main function of the division was, to help the federal ministry, divisions, departments, and other bodies in the rationalizations of the organizational structure. The functions should be a loyal and operational procedure, job design should be simple.

### Mr. Shoaib's in Report

Mr. Shoaib, then finance minister, as ahead of the standing organization committee, gave suggestions in light of the 1962 constitution.

- I. The federal government should establish an administrative unit, to maintain the line of communications between the province and the federal government.
- II. Replaced the Economic Committee with National Economic Council, headed by the finance minister as a chairman, provincial governor as deputy chairman, and planning commission as a member.
- III. Ministry was only responsible and accountable to policy implementation also following the policy.

### Mr. Professor Rowland Egger's Report

After the independence, Pakistan civil service needed to review and made some sort of reforms to design, the civil service according to modern and changing requirements. The foreign experts were invited to Pakistan, to review and made recommendations about the civil service.

Rowland Egger, a professor from the US, was the first to analyze the various reforms that were carried out in India prior to independence. The Indian Civil Service was the only organization that was under British control.

- I. The reforms were totally in the interest of those already in the service.
- II. Recruitment criteria and standards were isolated, lacked merit and skill, and educational criteria.
- III. The candidate appointed as a civil servant was bounded by many other responsibilities and duties, except their job. There was a lack of specialization according to the skills, education, and interest of the candidates.

### Mr. Egger gave some Recommendations

- I. In civil service, there should balance between the academic standards and other expertise and personals
- II. There would be limitations of responsibilities and little barriers to growth.
- III. Officers prioritized their work and subordinate to their duties and work rather than service or status.

### Mr. Barnard Gladieux Report

- I. Generalists controlled in administration created some kind of sense of isolation in the specialist.
- II. Specialists also had administrative skills, and technical skills in their respective fields so must be given equal opportunity.
- III. Effective policies in the government and civil service could only be designed when servants specialized in their field.

### Reforms under Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto

The first thorough civil services reforms were introduced by the then Prime Minister Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto. The removal of hundreds of public servants from Pakistan is commonly regarded as a step towards removing the country's constitutional protection. This also involves removing the elite civil service of the country.

The purpose of the reforms was to make civil services more flexible. Hence, the constitutional protection which ensured the independence and neutrality of civil servants was revoked. Occupational Groups were put in place instead of cadres, which introduced a unified structure of grading from BPS-1 to BPS-22. According to research, the new structure introduced rigidity and grade consciousness. There was a significant reduction in the financial remuneration of the civil servants as well. In addition, a common training program was introduced for all employees. The provincial and federal secretaries could retire without assigning any reason.

The CSP was divided into two groups: the District Management Group and the Tribal Areas Group. The DMG headed the administration in all of the settled districts, while the TAC handled the administrative tasks in the partially incorporated regions of the province of Balochistan. The All-Pakistan services, which used to be known as the Central Services, were now composed of the DMG, the TAC, the Policy Group, and the Secretariat Group. These groups were also referred to as the All-Pakistan Unified Group.

According to Benazir Bhutto, the quality of life in Pakistan has been greatly affected by the establishment of the *naukarshahi*. This institution has created a class of people who are not capable of identifying themselves with the people. Less than three months after taking office, Benazir retired over a thousand civil servants. One of her key policies was the implementation of a policy known as lateral recruitment. This was a way to increase the political influence of the bureaucracy and enable her to implement her programs and policies. The 1973 Constitution greatly affected the operations and effectiveness of the civil service. It removed certain protections that were included in previous constitutions. These included the right to retain and avoid being dismissed.

### Reforms under Zia ul-Haq Regime

As part of her efforts to transform the civil service, Zia issued a uniform dress code, enforced prayer breaks, and abolished all occupational groups. She also established a commission to reform the system. The commission was formed in 1978, but it left the reforms of 1973 intact. During the 1970s, the country's political and economic reforms began to crumble due to widespread corruption and incompetence. Following the military coup in 1977, the militarization of the bureaucracy also started to occur. In 1980, President Zia allowed retired military officers to be rehired in the federal bureaucracy. However, they would not be selected by the selection committee headed by the FPSC. The committee was also charged with filling the senior-level positions with high-ranking army officials. This led to the induction of many officers into the provincial and federal governments. Despite this, President Zia still maintained the military officers' entry into the civilian bureaucracy, which offset some of her reforms. The military's growing influence over the bureaucracy was the main reason why Zia wanted to retain some of the guarantees that the civil service provided. However, after realizing that he would be trying his own hand, he stopped pushing for further reforms.

## A Brief Review of Reforms Under Bhutto and Zia Regimes

### Administrative Reforms Committee 1973

On December 20, 1971, Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto announced that he would introduce various reforms to eliminate corruption from the country. In 1972, the Bhutto government fixed an administrative reform committee in the chairmanship of establishment minister Khurshid Hasan Meer.

Following are the objectives of the administrative reform committee (1973),

- I. Unification of service structure
- II. Obliteration of corruption
- III. Politically controlled and directed
- IV. Greater accountability
- V. Increase efficiency and transparency in departments
- VI. Public service structure change
- VII. Political stability
- VIII. Reforms in cadre system
- IX. Reorganization of recruiting
- X. Departmental reorganization
- XI. Reorganization and distribution of power
- XII. Culture change in civil service

This committee reexamined the previous work of

- a) Justice Munir Ahmed's report (1949),
- b) Jeffrie's report (1952),
- c) Egger report (1953),
- d) Gladiex report (1955),
- e) Shoaib report (1962),
- f) Cornelius inquiry (1969)

And made the final report called the Meer commission (1973).

### Meer commission (1973) Recommendation

- I. Recruit all civil bureaucracy based on merit
- II. The civil servant structure consists of four classes (1,2,3,4)

## Class System – Gazetted Posts

### Gazetted Posts

- Class 1-----Grade 17 to 23
- Class 2-----Grade 16

## Non -Gazetted Posts

- Class 2-----Grade 11 to 15
  - Class 3-----Grade 3 to 10
  - Class 4-----Grade 1 and 2
- III. Abolished classes system and replaced by a system of 22 grades known as (BPS) in all administrative structures. BPS (1-4) for the unskilled employee, BPS (5-15) for clerical personnel, BPS (16) for superintendents, and BPS (17-22) for officers according to the administration reform 1973 report.
- IV. Abolition of cadre system like C.S.P and were classified into all Pakistan unified grades, federal unified grades, and provincial unified grades. All Pakistan unified grades officers are posted to the provincial and federal government and consist of three occupational groups.
- District management group (BPS-17 to 22)
  - Police service of Pakistan (BPS-17 to 22)
  - Secretariat group (BPS-19 to 22)
- V. Federal unified grades are only posted to the federal government and consist of the following occupational groups.
- Accounts group,
  - Commerce, and trade group,
  - Customs and excise group,
  - Foreign service of Pakistan,
  - Income tax group,
  - Information group,
  - Military lands and cantonment group,
  - The office management group,
  - Postal group,
  - Railway group,
  - Economics and planner group.
- VI. Establishment of the joint pre-service training program. Pre-service training programs include

The common training program at civil service academy Lahore (6 to 9 months duration)

- Specialized training program in their respective academies (10-month duration)
- The unified structure of the grading system would enable promotion to the higher posts in the public service. It would

also allow employees to choose from among the various grade levels.

- The exact grades of each post would be decided by the job evaluation process. Individuals from the private sectors, such as banks and insurance, would also be considered for government service.
- In addition, lower-ranking government employees would be allowed to move to the higher grades. The age limit for the competitive examination would also be raised from 28 to 30.
- A lateral recruitment program was introduced, a well-qualified and talented individual was applied for the post of deputy secretary, joint secretary, and additional secretary through competitive examination
- Horizontal and vertical movements among cadres were also introduced.
- Abolition of numerous pay scales and establishment of the unified national pay scale, due to this act pay scale was the same for all the servant of the same Grade
- The service tribunal was also introduced. Service tribunal consists of a retired judge of high court as a chairman and two other members may be bureaucrats. The high court did not see the matter of civil servants but these service tribunals see all the matters of civil servants.
- Abolition of reservation posts for the central secretariat, district administration and replaced by a DMG group.
- Status of establishment division
- Pakistan military account, Pakistan railway account, and Pakistan Audit and account were all unified/ merged into accounts group
- Grade 1 was the lowest grade applicable for messengers and peon and grade 23 was the highest for the secretary-general post. There are 2-3 officers present for the post of secretary-general. Secretary was the head of the ministry, Secretary BPS-22, Additional secretary BPS-21, Joint secretary BPS-20, Deputy Secretary BPS-19, and lower grades for junior staff



### **Anwar -ul-Haq Report (1979)**

In 1979 president Zia al-Haq appointed a commission under the chairmanship of the chief justice of Pakistan Mr. Justice Anwar-ul-haq to report on the reorganization of the civil service of Pakistan and make a recommendation. The commission submitted the report to the Zia -ul-Haq in November 1979.

### **Recommendation of the Anwar -ul-Haq report (1979)**

- I. Recommended the establishment of Pakistan public service commission
- II. Inclusion of constitutional safeguard to civil servants. As indicated by the administrator reform committee, 1973 the service tribunal see the issues of civil servant, the service tribunal comprised of retire high court judge as a chairman and two other members but again proposal is made, the nullification of the service tribunal and high court see the issues of civil servant as found in article 8 and 182 of the constitution of 1956.

In 1983 four important changes in the service structure were made which are

1. Lateral recruitment of civil servants was abolished due to the lateral recruitment power and authority conflict produced in the civil servant.
2. Nonbureaucratic officers enter within the high post. After the 1973 reforms introduction of lateral recruitments was introduced in the civil servant and well-qualified and talented individual was applied for the post of deputy secretary, joint secretary, and additional secretary through competitive examination.
3. The tribal area group was merged into DMG (district management group)
4. The reservation for military personnel in civil service was expanded, 10% training of army officers, usually at Captain rank and identical position from naval and air force.

### **Pakistan Devolution Of Power Plan 2001**

The increasing politicization of the service during the 1990s has affected the appointment and transfer of officials. According to experts, the party's trueness often outdoes the merit of the decisions.

### **National Reconstruction Bureau**

The NRB was headed by Lt. Gen. Tanvir Naqvi, who was the architect of the 2001 devolution reform. The DOPP is a new initiative that aims to bring about a change in the governance of districts, which are the political units that are responsible for carrying out various tasks and activities in Pakistan. DOPP has been regarded as the most radical administrative reform in Pakistan's history. Its implementation was partly aided by the military's ability to carry out the plan. The international support provided by the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund also helped in its implementation. It was also advantageous for Pakistan when the country's reform agenda was supported by international organizations.

The Devolution Plan aims to implement various measures designed to improve the efficiency and effectiveness of the government.

1. The abolition of Executive Magistracy led to the restructuring of the office of the Deputy Commissioner. The new title of the DCO was changed from Deputy Commissioner to District Coordination Officer.
2. Under DOPP, the elected Zila Nazim was given additional powers, which were previously exercised by the former Deputy Commissioner.
3. For the first time, revenue collection was not handled by the district administration as it was delegated to other local public services such as health, education, and law enforcement.
4. The various functions and responsibilities of the central and provincial governments were devolved to the district governments.

5. The district administration was also under the scrutiny of local representatives and the public. It was also responsible for addressing the complaints of citizens.
6. In 2002, a comprehensive package of reforms was introduced for the police, which replaced the 1861 Police Act. This was the first time that the police had a developmental orientation. The relationship between the district police and the elected mayor was also changed. The Police Order 2002, which was enacted following the abolition of Executive Magistracy, gave the police complete control over the local law enforcement units.
7. The goal of the police reforms was to make the service more accountable to the people and to provide them with a professional and service-oriented environment. Some of the features of the reforms that have contributed to the country's governance are listed below.
8. The public accountability of the police through the establishment of local, provincial, and national public safety commissions.
9. The district police was also made accountable to the elected mayor. Despite this, there are still provisions in the law that allow the police to ignore lawful orders of political operatives.
10. Under the new system, the superintendent of police became the district police officer. He or she was also responsible for overseeing the operations of the local and provincial police forces.
11. The police force was also restructured on a functional basis. The prosecution service was also separated from the police through an independent organization.

Despite the various reforms, the implementation of these was not as successful as expected. The lack of fiscal decentralization and the limited administrative powers were also factors that affected the implementation of the

reforms. The implementation of new accountability structures also fell short.

A number of studies conducted on the reforms concluded that the public's preference was not reversed. In 2010, a study conducted by the Urban Institute stated that the public did not support the idea of giving the provinces more power over local government units. The chosen local government system could not deliver on its promise in 2008. The failure of the system was largely attributed to the lack of legitimacy that was present in the country's parenting regime. The reforms that were supposed to be implemented as part of the local government package were not carried out.

### **National Commission for Government Reform (Ncgr) 2008**

In 2006, the national commission for government reform (Ncgr) was formulated under the chairmanship of Dr. Ishrat Hussain and published a report in 2008. Following are the key objective of (Ncgr) formulation

- Revaluation of the existent occupational group of civil service at the federal and provincial level and proposed the new structure of the civil service including policies and composition relevant to training and development, recruitment, performance appraisal system, career development, disciplinary action, code of ethics, retirement, and benefits, promotion, benefits, and compensation
- Abolition of the groups/service
- Review the composition and size of civil service
- Division of work
- Review the Responsibilities of civil service officers

### **Recommendation of the Dr. Ishrat Hussain report (2008)**

1. Abolition of timely-based promotion (mean promotion based on seniority) and recommended Performance-based promotion (performance appraisal is a

method that helps the government to evaluate the performance of civil service officers.

2. Recommended OTM-R system (open, transparent, and merit-based recruitment) means to hire the best person for the job.
3. Following Mandatory training required for the promotion to the next grade
  - Post induction level
  - Mid-career level
  - Senior management level
4. A separate civil service department that is composed of regular civil servants at all levels of government in Pakistan.
5. Abolishment of fresh recruitment through the CSS examination in the following occupational groups
  - Office management group
  - Pakistan military lands and cantonment services
  - Pakistan railway service
  - Pakistan postal service
  - Information group
  - Commerce and trade group

### **Recommended Four-Tier Civil Service Structure**

#### **All Pakistan Services**

- I. For senior management positions in government, the National Executive Service is a competitive examination that can be used for all civil servants. Pakistan administrative service previously (DMG) (occupational group BS 17-22)
- II. Police service of Pakistan (occupational group BS 17-22)

#### **Federal Civil Service (BS 17 TO 22)**

- I. Pakistan foreign services
- II. Pakistan audit and account service
- III. Pakistan taxation service with two cadres for custom and inland revenue

#### **Provincial Civil Service (BS 17 TO 22)**

- I. Provincial management service
- II. Provincial executive service

- III. Provincial technical and professional service
- IV. Provincial judicial service

### **District Civil Service (ITO 16)**

The government's changing apparatus is regarded as a dynamic process that has been under the spotlight since it was established in 2006. The NCGR was established by the military regime in 2006 to carry out comprehensive reforms.

### **Fair Recruitment**

It generally stresses transparent merit-based recruitment to all levels and grades of public services while protecting regional representation as laid down in the constitution.

### **Performance Management and Appraisals**

Performance evaluation is a process that involves assessing and measuring the effectiveness of an individual's performance. This evaluation is usually carried out in order to establish a set of measurable objectives and develop key performance indicators.

### **Equality**

The system of mixed approaches for different factions in a different was an enigma so to prevent being stretched out, equality of opportunity for career advancement to all the employees was suggested.

### **Replacement**

The replacement of the concept of superior service and to form a single service for all the cadres irrespective of the Federal and Provincial Civil Services, professionals, and generalists.

### **Compensation and Benefits**

A wide range of compensation and benefits plan for the employees of all the services

### **Separate Cadre**

A separate cadre of regular Civil Services at the Federal, Provincial, and District levels co-existing



with contractual appointments and lateral movement.

1. Creation of separate National Executive Service (NES) to fill highest executive positions through competitive examinations.
2. The formation of three new Cadres namely economic management, social management followed a general cadre.
3. A specific mechanism for seeing the responsiveness through a score formation by citizen surveys and scores.

### Dr. Ishrat Hussain’s Commission 2019

After the 2018 general election, the Imran Khan-led government formed a task force under the supervision of Dr. Ishrat Hussain

The task force on institutional reforms was established to review the existing training system to make it more relevant to the needs of public service delivery and governance. The 3-6 month post-induction training aims to build comprehensive skills inter alia communication and inter-personal skills for those entering the federal government in various cadres. The training would be organized by the National School of Public Policy (NSPP). This training should also focus on the indulgence of the individual in the organization’s culture, rules, and procedures.

- I. The National School of Public Policy (NSPP) would be the highest body for quality assurance in terms of monitoring and standard settings for maximum enhancement of the quality delivery whereas the course and contents would largely be dependent on the training institution itself.
- II. To bring in highly qualified officers having integrity, behavior, and competence, the overall mechanism of staffing and structure of incentives should be brought in line with the NSPP along with the training institutes.

- III. All the training institutes shall be made autonomous with their boards of governors drawn from academia, practitioners, retired civil servants, etc. Linkages with leading universities and research organizations shall be established.

### The Current Structure of the Civil Services

The public service commission of Pakistan conducts the CSS examinations for various occupational groups. Some of these include the customs service of Pakistan, the police service of Pakistan, the inland revenue service of the country, and the office management and secretariat.

### Present Criteria for Recruitment

Quota	Percentage
Merit	7.5
Punjab including Islamabad	50
Sindh urban	7.6
Sindh rural	11.4
KPK	11.5
Baluchistan	6
Northern area and FATA	4

### Conclusion

Civil services reforms are imperative for effective service delivery, transparent government, and the socio-economic well-being of the general masses. Reforms stressing on implementing policies of the government should be backed by a sound system of checks and balances. A vibrant and proactive civil service is in dire need of the hour to combat challenges on hand. Such a vigilant civil service can lead Pakistan towards quality democracy.

## References

- Hussain, I. (2018). *Governing the Ungovernable*. Karachi: Oxford University Press.
- International Crisis Group. (2010). *Reforming Pakistan's Civil Service, Asia Report N0 185*.
- Iqbal, F. (2014) 'An analysis of administrative reforms in Pakistan's public sector'. PhD thesis. University of Bedfordshire.
- Javaid, U. & Ramzan, M. (2013). Police Order 2002: A critique. *Journal of Political Studies*, 20(2), 141-160.
- Kennedy, C. (1987). *Bureaucracy in Pakistan*. Karachi: Oxford University Press.
- Khan, J. R. (2017). Government and administration in Pakistan. Lahore, [Pakistan] : Peace Publications.
- Khan, S. (2005). *Public Administration with Special Reference to Pakistan*. Adfo Books.
- NCGR. (2008). National Commission For Government Reforms On Reforming The Government In Pakistan. [https://www.pc.gov.pk/uploads/report/NCGR\\_Vol\\_I-1.pdf](https://www.pc.gov.pk/uploads/report/NCGR_Vol_I-1.pdf)
- Reforming Pakistan's Civil Service. (2016, August 19). Crisis Group. <https://www.crisisgroup.org/asia/south-asia/pakistan/reforming-pakistan-s-civil-service>
- Mehboob, S. R. (2018, September 16). Civil Service Reform – learning from the past. Daily Times. <https://dailytimes.com.pk/298576/civil-service-reform-learning-from-the-past/>
- Shafqat, S. & Wahla, S. (2021). *Experimenting with Democratic Governance: The Impact of the 2001 Local Government Ordinance on Pakistan's Bureaucracy*. Oxford University Press
- UNDP, UNOPS. (2012). *Voices of the unheard: Legal Empowerment of the Poor in Pakistan*.
- Wilder, A. (2010). The Politics of Civil Service Reform in Pakistan. *Columbia Journal of International Affairs*. <https://jia.sipa.columbia.edu/politics-civil-service-reform-pakistan>