



Unveiling the Subaltern Voices: A Study of the Bull and the She Devil



Muhammad Irfan

MPhil, Department of English Language and Literature, Riphah International University, Faisalabad, Punjab, Pakistan.

Iqra Hameed

University of Education, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan.

Abstract: *The tale "The The Bull and She Devil" by Zaibunnisa Hamidullah focuses on the experiences of people who are that are oppressed and marginalized by social structure, echoing the concept of subalternity as conceived in the work of Antonio Gramsci. This study explores how this story exposes voice of the subaltern, describing the difficulties and obstacles that people of lower status. Based on an analysis based on Gramsci's theories, this research explores the experiences of the characters as they struggle to resist the hegemonic power structures. Abstracts also highlight that the tale shows the desire of the marginalized of empowerment and agency even though they are enslaved by the dominant society forces.*

Key Words: Subaltern, Power Dynamics, Resistance

Corresponding Author: Muhammad Irfan (MPhil, Department of English Language and Literature, Riphah International University, Faisalabad, Punjab, Pakistan. Email: mirfansp5678@gmail.com)

Introduction

Subalternity as defined by Antonio Gramsci, refers to being considered to be marginalized or subordinate in a hierarchy of social status. It is the term used to describe people or groups that are disregarded by ruling power structures and often are silent or ignored in a society. Subalternity is not only an absence of economic or political power but also an absence of intellectual and cultural authority (Green. M, 2002). Different scholars have enriched Gramsci's idea of subaltern and added the necessary depth and nuance to his knowledge:

Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak: Spivak is known for her significant essay "Can the

subaltern speak?" The essay challenges Western feminist thought for advocating for the voices of women who are not taking in the voices of women who are subaltern (Spivak, G. C 2023). Spivak stresses the importance of allowing groups from subaltern backgrounds to express their personal stories and questions the assumption about Western intellectual superiority. The author, Ranajit Guha: Guha, a historian, applied the concept of Gramsci of subalternity to the research of Indian the history of India. Guha argued that the traditional historical narratives frequently ignored the perspective and role of subaltern communities including peasants as well as tribal societies. Guha's research highlighted the necessity historians consider the actions



and voices of marginalized groups when determining historic events. Dipesh Chakrabarty: Chakrabarty, in his book "Provincializing Europe" analyzes the concept of subalternity in the postcolonial context. He claims that Eurocentric views have been dominant in stories of culture and history and have marginalized non-Western perspectives. Chakrabarty is calling for a revision of historical events from the point of view of the subaltern and contesting the predominant narratives about contemporary and development (Chaturvedi, 2007).

Partha Chatterjee: In "The Nation and its Fragments," Chatterjee delves into the idea that the political system exists independently of civil society. According to the author, subaltern groups typically function within the political system and engage in various types of opposition and negotiation outside of official political organization structures. His study works on the opportunity of subaltern communities to develop their political identities. The notion of subalternity has enabled the comprehension of resistance and power, the function of agency in society, as well as a re-evaluation of dominant accounts. It has emphasized the need to listen and raise the voices of those who often don't have a chance to tell their story (Kaiwar, 2015).

Antonio Gramsci, an Italian Marxist philosopher and a theorist of politics, was the first to introduce the notion of subalternity as a concept that works in concert with all his broader studies of hegemony and the power dynamic within populations. As a consequence of his work, Gramsci used the social word "subalterns" in his writings, the Prison Notebooks in particular, to refer to that part of the society that cannot exercise its autonomy and is repressed and regulated by the class of power. Gramsci's definition of subalternity is not limited to political and economic subordination; it is much broader than that and encompasses cultural and

philosophical dimensions of both the governed and the governance. According to him, the general populace views the personal ideas, values, and worldviews of that ruling elite as natural or common sense, which enables the ruling class to assert its power in the society beyond coercion.

According to Gramsci, subalterns are not just passive sufferers of injustice; they are capable of being empowered and resisting it. By defying the dominant paradigm and imagining novel political and cultural ideologies, the subaltern could undermine the dominator's authority. This notion of colonialism, offering a conceptual and methodological paradigm for approaching complex and de facto ambiguous contests for oppression and power, has had a profound impact on postcolonial studies and many other branches of knowledge as well so it serves as a means of understanding thought. Opening the voices of minority writers means exposing the perspectives, backgrounds and lives of oppressed and ignored groups previously considered invisible and marginalized. This requires empathetic reading and inquiry into, and a better understanding of, the political and social contexts in which the texts were written. It is possible to uncover the voices of the subaltern precisely by analyzing the textual data and looking at the language, images, narrative, and ways that marginalized groups are portrayed. Understanding the ideas that individuals endorse or object to along, with how they express their viewpoints can be insightful. (Biswas, 2020).

Another way is to contextualize the literary work in the time and place to comprehend the roles of societal power structures in mediating the representation of the subaltern. For example, I could research the history of the subject, the social media's target audience, or the sociopolitical "why now" at the time. Also, working with subaltern authors often requires seeing the

material from a perspective that challenges the default story and identifies alternative voices. One way to do this is to seek the type of “evidence of what is missing,” such as the instances of the narrative making no sense, or instances when important knowledge about the subaltern feels silent, garbled, or discredited. Bringing attention to the perspectives of marginalized communities, in works requires attention to detail, an understanding of the broader context and a willingness to question established beliefs.

In Antonio Gramsci's theory individuals, on the fringes of society are known as subalterns. These are marginalized groups that often face oppression from those, in power and struggle to have their voices heard. Examples of subalterns may encompass peasants, workers and other oppressed communities who lack the influence of the ruling class. Gramsci argues that these marginalized individuals have the potential to shape society through the use of their cultural strategies rather than simply standing as victims. In Zaibunnisa Hamidullah's "The Cow and the Devil", the main characters portray the challenges and realities faced by the privileged. Through their stories, this story sheds light on individuals who are often overlooked and made up they behave abnormally trying to frame their identities and their life stories ideologically.

Indeed, others have analyzed the immigration proposal. Gayatri Chakravorty She has extended Gramsci's theories by adding strong representations of subordinate women as examples she pointed out. According to Spivak, in order to acknowledge their unique roles in leading power structures, women need to pay attention to, understand and engage with the perspectives of colonized individuals this research uses Gramsci's principle of the subaltern to evaluate "The Bull as well as She Evil one". We'll examine in this study how the characters' experiences highlight the greater

dynamics of agency, resistance, and power. In doing this we will try to improve the understanding of subalternity within literature, and the significance of it in broader contexts of socio-politics.

Problem Statement

The tale "The The She Devil and the Bull" (1958) from Zaibunnisa Hamidullah is a story that explores the lives of marginalized people by highlighting their challenges and their experiences. The story's portrayal of the voices of people who are subaltern raises concerns as to whether the voices of these characters are truly depicted and the extent to which they definitely combat dominant narratives. The study seeks to understand the way in which subaltern voices are represented in the narrative, looking at the methods used to reveal these voices, and examining the meanings of the representations from the standpoint of the theory of subalternity of Antonio Gramsci.

Research Questions

1. How are the subaltern voices represented and unveiled in The Bull and the She Devil?
2. How do these representations challenge dominant hegemonic narratives?

Literature Review

"Can the Subaltern Speak?" by Gayatri Chakravorty is an important essay in the field of postcolonial theories that analyzes the ways people who are marginalized, or "the subaltern," are silenced and excluded from the discourse. Spivak's essay provides a critical reaction to the ideas by French philosopher Michel Foucault and his concept of knowledge-based power, which indicates that power is not only repressive, but also a source of knowledge. The subject of the essay, Spivak focuses on the situation of practice of sati in the colonial period of India

and the widows who were required to burn themselves at the funeral of their husbands (Mignolo, W. D, [1994](#)). She asserts that Western feminists that sought to shield subaltern women from being sati, were in fact enhancing the colonial power structures and silence women's voices their own. Her main argument is that the marginalized cannot participate in structures that oppress them since their voices have already been excluded and silenced. Spivak draws for attention to the complexity of representation as well as the difficulties in voicing those who were historically marginalized from the power structure (Green, [2011](#)).

"Subaltern Studies Writings concerning South Asian History and Society," edited by Ranajit Guha the book is a collection of writings that have become a major change in South Asian historiography. Guha together with the others who are part of The Subaltern Studies collective, sought to dispel the dominant stories of Indian historical events that are often created from the point of view of the colonial elite organizations. Guha along with his fellow scholars believed that the traditional history of India tends to ignore the perspectives and voices of groups that were marginalized including peasants tribal groups, and lower castes. They came up with the phrase "subaltern" in reference to those groups, and set out to discover their stories and their perspectives (Pandey, [1995](#)).

In the writings included in this collection, Guha and other contributors examined different aspects of life in the subaltern world such as resistance movements as well as cultural practices and every day experiences. They believed that subaltern groups had a significant role in determining their own destiny and that their history was essential to gaining a better knowledge of South Asian society. In general "Subaltern Studies" marked a change towards a more inclusive bottom-up view of the study of history, challenging conventional narratives and drawing attention to the role of groups

that are marginalized. Guha's work and Subaltern Studies as a Subaltern Studies collective has had an enormous influence on the study of postcolonial studies. It has actually affected academics that research studies problems connected to social justice power, together with depiction (Brett, P. & Guyver, [2021](#)).

Dipesh Chakrabarty analyzes the importance of Subjugated Researches as well as the Subjugated Researches effort in the context of postcolonial objection in his short article Subjugated researches as postcolonial objection. With its focus on the experiences plus perspectives of subjugated populaces Subjugated Researches, as a cumulative has actually assisted to redefine the postcolonial area. Chakrabarty analyzes this connection. Chakrabarty highlights just how important the term "" subjugated is to comprehend the ins and outs of colonial coupled with postcolonial worlds (Bahl, [1997](#)). According to him, the subaltern is greater than simply a collection of downtrodden individuals since it offers a voice and also a system to oppose solid power structure of authority. Scientist can find out about the different means subaltern cultures tested the colonial system as well as explored their very own identifications by focusing on the subaltern (Mohanty, [1988](#)).

Within the context of the Subaltern Researches effort, Chakrabarty stresses the relevance of tale coupled with depiction. According to him the Subaltern researcher job's focus on redeeming subaltern voices postures an obstacle to the traditional historical stories that occasionally downplay or reject those viewpoints. Scientist in the area of Subaltern Researches have actually shown with their job exactly how different stories can assist us fathom postcolonial plus colonial people on a much deeper degree (Pillay, [2017](#)). The primary debate made in Chakrabarty's essay is that Subaltern Researches is a crucial kind of postcolonial objection that uses fresh point of views on the

past, power, resistance as well as the context of imperialism plus its results. It additionally highlights the significance of marginalized areas (Pole, [2003](#)).

Offered Partha Chatterjee's job Colonialism, Realm plus the Principle of the Subaltern "the principle of the subaltern is analyzed in regard to colonial plus imperial prominence. According to Chatterjee, the term subaltern describes a setting of subordination produced by colonialism instead of just an expression utilized to explain those that are maltreated (Saldanha, [2023](#)). Chatterjee questions the standard Marxist analysis of the subaltern as a course that encounters financial difficulty yet competes that this analysis disregards the different types of prominence plus resistance that define colonial culture. According to his proposition, the meaning of subaltern is established by one's association with the colonial federal government which enforced laws and also management structures that set apart in between conquered together with non-conquered individuals (Al-wazedi, 2020).

Additionally, Chatterjee is the initial to coin the term "" political culture"" to describe the sector of the underclass in the colonial state that does not fit right into the main system. According to him a political culture is specified by its very own collection of legislations controlling power plus culture which regularly encounter the objectives of the colonial federal government (Prakash, [1994](#)). Ammunition's thesis of Chatterjee's publication supplies a thorough as well as refined description of the made complex political and also social group of the subaltern which is formed by colonial plus royal pressures. He insists that-in order to resist colonial guideline coupled with traditional tales of flexibility plus resistance it is necessary to identify the stamina as well as freedom of the subaltern. Gramsci, Hegemony, and the Law" written by Paul Passavant explores the relevance to Antonio

Gramsci's idea of hegemony in the realm of legal theory and law practice. Hegemony theory by Gramsci is referring to the manner that dominant groups within society keep their power in check through shaping the attitudes, values and norms of the society in order to warrant that their needs are viewed as normal.

In his writings, Gramsci argued that the ruling class is in control by coercion and by the permission of the oppressed, facilitated by altering the culture and social institutions. Passavant applies the ideas of Gramsci in the field of law and concludes that the law plays an important role in maintaining of hegemony, by promoting the rights for the elite class. His work demonstrates the significance in understanding the significance of the law in perpetuating social inequalities and the necessity for lawyers and scholars to examine critically the methods by which law could be employed to counter dominant power structures and encourage equality for all. (Qamar, [2024](#)).

The critical method, also known as stylistics employs linguistic techniques and findings to analyse literature. The study focuses on the issue of sexuality within a patriarchal society using an analysis of the stylistic nature specifically focusing on the shorter story Bull and the She Devil by Zaibunnisa Haidullah, one of the pioneering Pakistani female writer that played an important role in the beginning stages in the development of Pakistani English literature. The theory proposed in the book Leech as well as Short (2007) that can be broken down into four major categories-- Lexical Category, Grammatical Categories, Figures of Speech, as well as Context and Cohesion--has been employed for the analysis of stylistics. The research comes at an conclusion that the author has successfully tackles a controversial subject but without revealing too much thanks to her unique, simple and yet sensitive style (Hashim, [2021](#)).

The theme can be described as a major notion, concept or claim in the story. Symbolic language is a literary method which employs symbols--words, figures marks, locations as well as abstract concepts--to communicate the meaning that is not actually meant. Themes are "whatever the text says about the subject matter," whereas theme conceptions refer to what readers "believe to be the subject of the piece." Analyzing and discussing the symbolic elements and themes of Zaib-Un-Nisa's novel "The The Bull and the The Devil" was the principal goal of this study. She is known as the pioneer in Pakistan's literary studies for women. She's made a major impact on English literature. Her short story collection, "The Young Wife and Other Stories" examines the experience as well as expressions of sexuality an unhappily state within an environment dominated by males. The research is qualitative and helps to explain the story's various symbols and themes. "The bull and Devil" one of Hamidullah's earlier stated collection of stories is a perfect example for the research. Alongside examining the challenges and limiting psychological state of women living in masculine society, this study is also a look at the psychological way of thinking and the dilemma faced by the young rural man's physical, mental, and emotional state with regard to his relationship to his wife. By using symbols and interpretations the author slyly deals on taboo issues without becoming open about it (Urooj, 2023).

Theoretical Framework

When analyzing "The The Bull and She Devil" written by Zaibunnisa Hamidullah, through the concept of subalternity, as suggested by Antonio Gramsci, one can examine the theme of hegemony, power, as well as resistance within the narrative. Gramsci's notion of subaltern describes marginalized groups within society, who are under the oppression of established structures and

ideologies. They include workers, peasants as well as other people who are marginalized, are not able to access hegemonic power and often are ostracized or excluded from the society. Gramsci asserts that the ruling classes are able to maintain their position by imposing their cultural hegemony. It means that the dominant elite can impose its views and outlook on the rest of the society. The subaltern is those who suffer from the power and injustice. The concept of the subaltern, which is inherently linked to Gramsci's ideas about the resistance and the role of culture and intellectuals in that resistance, is his creation.

Therefore, one can analyze how the narrative typified in "The Bull and the Devil" relays the subaltern's predicaments. The woman devil might be a metaphor for subversion or opposition to these repressive forces, while the bull might be a metaphor for indicators of society motivated by the yearning for supremacy. Viewed in such a manner, it might be portrayed as an assault on power and societal arrangements, for the devil's actions may be framed as a societal disturbance from below. Other scholars have also advanced our exercise of the concept subaltern. In her article entitled "Can the subaltern speak?" Gayatri Chakravorty criticizes Western depictions of the subaltern, while also stressing the need to afford minority groups a voice. Likewise, when considering Subaltern Studies, it is impossible to overlook Ranajit Guha, who observed the history and the present of subaltern communities in South Asia, stressing their direct effect on historical representations. Hence, once approached from the perspective of Gramsci's notion of the subaltern, "The Bull and the She Fear" can be comprehended in terms of power, submission, and the subjugation of a marginalized group. It aids in our comprehension of how the characters' deeds mirror both the broader issues with hegemony and the fight for freedom.

Antonio Gramsci defines the term subalternity as entities that are oppressed, excluded and denied proper rights and access by the ruling classes in a society. It is a privileged status with political, economic and cultural rights. Thus subaltern are lesser to their status or rank. The subaltern classes are devoid of any such power in political, economic and other institutional domains of the society. They are people belonging to various classes be it the proletariat, peasants, indigenous people etc. The people who are denied access to the mainstream power structures and hence, denied access to the dominant culture are classified as subaltern. The concept of subaltern existence is an integral part of the theory of hegemony. This concept is symbolic of the way in which the thoughts and values of one class become the thoughts and values of society universally. According to Gramsci, the ruling class do not merely maintain power by means of force, but have also created a structure of institutions, values and cultural mores that reinforce their power, while those on the lower end of the spectrum are kept in their place by a process of cultural hegemony in which they are marginalized and silenced. The ability to communicate dreams and aspirations for alternative futures has thus been removed from the grip of the underprivileged.

"Subaltern," in Gramsci's conception, underscores their subordination within the social, historical, and hegemonic order. He contends that for those groups to work against the dominant ideologies and hierarchies, they must develop what he terms a counter-hegemonic consciousness. And it is the task of cultural and intellectual producers to represent and give voice to the struggles, aspirations, and desires of those who are oppressed and to assist in the articulation of a more inclusive and radically democratic society. To be sure, we must address such questions to be able to interpret the exercise of power and the dynamics of

domination and resistance in any given social formation. We must also recognize the ways in which subalternity speaks to and for those who are persistently unheard and unseen. So to me, the other function of the concept of subaltern in Gramsci's work is to render visible and audible those who are all but erased and relegated to oblivion. In sum, then, subalternity in Gramsci offers us an evocative and provocative way of theorizing and understanding the complex dynamics, as well as the power, strength, and force, of different modes and strategies of subordination, resistance, and the quest for freedom and justice.

Analysis

"She did so with gentle, reassuring fingers, and the animal, quieter now, allowed her to lead it to its stall and tie it up. 'Shabash! Shabash!' shouted the children in great glee. 'Shabash auntie, you have succeeded where uncle could not.' Ghulam Qadir, who had been standing for the past few minutes watching his wife, was galvanized into action by the words. With a quick flick of his powerful arm, he caught hold of a handful of his wife's long black hair and, with it, dragged her down to the ground before him. Then he hit her with the stick held in his hand. Once, twice, and three times, the blows fell, each time more forcefully." (Hamidullah, 1958).

As a reference to Antonio Gramsci's idea of subalternity this quote is a reflection of the violence and power dynamics within a hierarchical system. The subaltern in this scene, which is represented by the woman in the above scene, is the subject of humiliation and physical violence by her husband, who symbolizes the dominant class of hegemony. The woman's actions of soothing the animal, and being praised by the children is in stark contrast to her husband's rage and highlighting the subaltern's capacity to exercise agency and aplomb in spite of being marginalized. The concept of subaltern focuses on groups who are considered to be

socially and politically marginalized which is often devalued and marginalized by the dominant group. In this instance her actions show an act of rebellion or agency because she can succeed when her husband isn't. The husband's violent reaction highlights the power of oppression in the dominant class, and also the limits imposed upon the subaltern's authority. This quote is a good example of the complicated power dynamics as well as the struggle for authority in the society. It also reflects the notions of subalternity and the struggle for power that is central to Gramsci's idea of.

"She had succeeded in doing what he could not end. She had shamed him before the whole village by bringing the bull passively home; he had struck her full in the face. This he had then, not so much to hurt her as to proclaim to the village that he was master and this was his woman, even though the bull was his animal." (Hamidullah. Z, [1958](#)).

Within the context of Antonio Gramsci's notion of subalternity and the subaltern, this quote demonstrates the dynamic of power and control in a hierarchical system. The actions of the husband, driven by the need to establish his authority and masculinity is an affirmation of an hegemonic authority over both the bull as well as his wife. In physically attacking his wife before the entire village, he will try to establish his authority as a master, and to assert the authority of his position not just over the bull but also the woman he is claiming to represent the control he has over properties and his personal. The success of the wife in getting bull back to her home in a passive manner opposes his use of force which highlights her agency and her ability to fulfil an objective without using force. The husband's violence serves to reinforce his authority and ensure the order of society that entitles him as the king. The remark reflects the wider idea of subordination and resistance in the Gramsci's notion of subaltern. Although the wife is successful with the bull, she's ultimately subjected the

violence of her husband, showing the limitations of her power in a world governed by unjust power relationships.

"Ghulam Qadir pushed aside the lota with disgust, and, seeing a port of motia flowers in a corner on which waxen blooms had opened up their scented sweetness, with a wild gesture of anger, he stretched towards the plant and, with one mighty pull, uprooted it." (Hamidullah. Z, [1958](#)).

As a reference to Antonio Gramsci's idea of the marginalized, this passage is interpreted as a symbol of rebellion and defiance towards the oppressive power of Ghulam Qadir's actions, especially his act of removing the motia flower, could be interpreted as a sign of his anger and frustration toward the social system that oppresses the individual. The action of removing the flowers could be interpreted as a protest against the current system of power. In removing something that is attractive and beautiful, Ghulam Qadir is symbolically refusing to accept the concept of sweetness and beauty which is forced upon him by the ruling class. This can be understood as a type of protest as a method to allow Ghulam Qadir, a Muslim from Pakistan, to assert the autonomy and power of his own even in the face of being oppressed. Based on the concept that of "Unveiling the Subaltern Voices," this quotation highlights the subaltern's potential to fight and resist even when confronted with the overwhelming force. This quote suggests that the subaltern is not merely an oppressed victim instead, it is an active actor who is capable of disrupting the dominant narratives and systems.

"He had run in search of an animal, and she had followed him. He knew this, although she kept her distance. And the knowledge brought his hatred of her to the surface again. 'She, Devil!' he had thought. I'll show her who the owner of the bull is, and I'll show her whose command it obeys." (Hamidullah. Z, [1958](#)).

In the context of Antonio Gramsci's idea of subalternity this quote illustrates the dynamic of power and control in the structure of a hierarchy. Ghulam Qadir's ideas reveal his feelings of entitlement and superiority as the keeper of the bull, which demonstrates his status within the ruling class. The derogatory name "She Devil" to his wife is his try to take her down and claim his superiority over his wife. This quote also reveals the subaltern's internalization and acceptance of dominant beliefs and power structures. Even though he is marginalized and ostracized, Ghulam Qadir still sees himself as being superior to his wife. This reflects the ways in which subaltern people accept and reinforce their subordination. Within the context of "Unveiling the Voices of Subalterns" this passage encapsulates the complexity of subaltern agency and resistance. When Ghulam Qadir tries to establish the power of his family while his wife's actions in following him, even in a distant manner, seem to suggest the possibility of silent resistance or resistance. It suggests that, even when oppression is present that the marginalized may be able to find ways to claim their rights and challenge dominant stories, but in subtle manners.

"In a sudden outburst of fury, he clenched his fist at his lovely face. Shaitan shouted. She Devil!! She Devil!! She Devil!!" Frenziedly, he picked up a stone and hurdled it into the well. Aiming straight into her eyes." (Hamidullah. Z, [1958](#)).

Based on Antonio Gramsci's notion of subalternity the quote above demonstrates the oppressive and violent nature of the dominant class against those who are who are marginalized. Ghulam Qadir's actions, such as clenching his fist, and throwing stones at his wife's face show the deep anger and determination to assert control and authority over his wife. In the use of offensive terms such as "She Devil" discredits his wife and strengthening his conviction of his

superiority over her and inferiority. The quotation also points out the dynamics of gender in the subaltern setting. The woman who is depicted as a victim to domestic violence, is a subaltern female who is subject to the oppression of patriarchy and violence. Ghulam Qadir's behavior reflects larger social norms and structures which perpetuate violence based on gender and inequity. Within the context of "Unveiling Subaltern Voices" Subaltern Voices," this statement emphasizes the necessity of fight back against powerful power structures that oppress people. It is a powerful reminds us of the difficulties with which subalterns are confronted especially women and the necessity of amplifying their stories and perspectives for changes in society and to bring justice.

"He was her master and would force her to bring forth the fruits of her womb; even the fields gave up their abundance to him." (Hamidullah. Z, [1958](#)).

In the context of Antonio Gramsci's idea of subalterns This quote is a reflection of the dominance and power structure of the ruling class which is represented by Ghulam Qadir, and the subaltern represented by his wife. The expression "He served as her master" refers to the hierarchical relation that Ghulam Qadir asserts his power and dominance over his spouse. The dominance goes beyond domestic boundaries and is evident in the mention of the fields releasing their bounty in his name, indicating his power over resources as well as the source of income. Within the context of "Unveiling the Subaltern Voices," this passage focuses on oppression and subjugation of those who are marginalized, especially women who are subject to oppressive patriarchal systems. Quotation for Blackboards this quote magnifies the struggle to resist these structures of power to gain freedom and equality for the oppressed. Having a woman "bring forth the fruit from the baby," indicates that a woman is assigned the

responsibility to given birth and meet societal demands, thus giving up her freedom and choice as an individual.

Conclusion

Zaibunnisa Hamidullah's story "The Bull and She Devil" is an excellent example to delineate the concept of subalternity. The narrative of such political prisoners shedding their blood and facing inhuman and humiliating torture only to make a house "home" makes She Devil's voice almost lapidarian. The story becomes an instance of what we currently understand as counter-narrative. In the story the character of She Devil becomes a synecdoche for an oppressed class when Ghulam Qadir, the subalternant figure, lords over her by his will: his physical force dominating her body. Ghulam Qadir not only supports the dominant class by being an oppressor, he also has that male privilege: the overwhelming might of physical force. His duty is forced on him

because in many ways, class struggle is a zero-sum game. The subaltern class cannot rise unless and until the dominant class feigns power.

The devil's perseverance and quiet determination is a testament to his ability to challenge the power of minority voices despite oppression. His ability to resist and continue adversity demonstrates the strength and resilience of minority cultures. In that resistance and resilience are possible even in the face of pressure "Bull and his." She Devil" story ultimately offers insight into the complex nature of the immigrant experience and the struggle for autonomy and power in marginalized communities. It is a gripping read. The novel challenges readers to think theoretically forms of oppression, domination and resistance by mirroring Gramsci's concept of diaspora, it encourages audiences to hear the perspectives and stories of those marginalized or ignored in society.

References

- Bahl, V. (1997). Relevance (or irrelevance) of subaltern studies. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 1333-1344. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/4405482>
- Biswas, M. (2020). Partha Chatterjee and Political Thought: Community, Culture, and the Present. In Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Communication. <https://doi.org/10.1093/acrefore/9780190228613.013.617>
- Brett, P., & Guyver, R. (2021). Postcolonial history education: Issues, tensions and opportunities. *Historical Encounters*, 8(2), 1-17. <https://doi.org/10.52289/hej8.210>
- Chaturvedi, V. (2007). A critical theory of subalternity: Rethinking class in Indian historiography. *Left History: An Interdisciplinary Journal of Historical Inquiry and Debate*, 12(1). <https://doi.org/10.25071/1913-9632.15042>
- Green, M. (2002). Gramsci cannot speak: Presentations and interpretations of Gramsci's concept of the subaltern. *Rethinking marxism*, 14(3), 1-24. <https://doi.org/10.1080/089356902101242242>
- Green, M. E. (2011). Rethinking the subaltern and the question of censorship in Gramsci's Prison Notebooks. *Postcolonial Studies*, 14(4), 387-404. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13688790.2011.641913>
- Hamidullah, Z. (1958). The bull and she devil. <https://doi.org/10.36348/sijll.2021.v04i10.002>
- Hashim, A. (2021). A Study of Themes and Symbols used in „The Bull and She Devil“ by Zaib-Un-Nisa Hamidullah. *Sch Int J Linguist Lit*, 4(10), 335-340. <https://doi.org/10.36348/sijll.2021.v04i10.002>
- Kaiwar, V. (2015). The Politics of (Postcolonial) History: the case of Provincializing Europe. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctt7rsxg>
- Mignolo, W. D. (1994). Are subaltern studies postmodern or postcolonial? The politics and sensibilities of geo-cultural locations. *dispositio*, 19(46), 45-73. <https://doi.org/10.23943/princeton/9780691156095.003.0005>
- Mohanty, C. (1988). Under Western eyes: Feminist scholarship and colonial discourses. *Feminist review*, 30(1), 61-88. <https://doi.org/10.1057/fr.1988.42>
- Pandey, G. (1995). Voices from the edge: The struggle to write subaltern histories. *Ethnos*, 60(3-4), 223-242. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00141844.1995.9981519>
- Pillay, P. (2017). The relevance of Antonio Gramsci's concept of hegemony to apartheid and post-apartheid South Africa. *Gender and Behaviour*, 15(2), 8678-8692.
- Pole, J. R., & Paul, A. (2003). Passavant, No Escape: Freedom of Speech and the Paradox of Rights (New York: New York University Press, *Journal of American Studies*, 37(3), 505-506.
- Prakash, G. (1994). Subaltern studies as postcolonial criticism. *The American historical review*, 99(5), 1475-1490. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2168385>
- Qamar, R., Anwar, S., & Shah, S. U. (2024). An Analysis of Connell's Theory of Hegemonic Masculinity in the Bull and she Devil by Zaib un Nissa Hamidullah. *International Journal of Human and Society*, 4(1), 86-92. <https://ijhs.com.pk/index.php/IJHS/article/view/364>
- Saldanha, D. (2023). *The Subaltern Subject in Structured Historical Process: Towards an Epistemological Approach*. Taylor & Francis.
- Spivak, G. C. (2023). *Can the subaltern speak?. In Imperialism (171-219)*. Routledge.
- Urooj, L. (2023). A Critical Analysis of Figurative Language Style found in Manto's Short Story 'The Tears of Candle': A Literary Stylistic Perspective. Available at SSRN 4514160. <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.4514160>