

## Dialectal Phonology: The Analysis of American and Pakistani English Pronunciation by Balochi Speakers at SBK Women's University Quetta, Balochistan

### Gul Aizaz

Lecturer, Department of English,  
Abdul Wali Khan University  
Mardan, KP, Pakistan.

### Gul Khanda

PhD Scholars, Department of  
English Linguistics, at IIUI,  
Islamabad, Pakistan.

Email: [gul.phdeng209@student.iiu.edu.pk](mailto:gul.phdeng209@student.iiu.edu.pk)

(Corresponding Author)

**Abstract:** Native languages frequently interfere with English, the study examines the phonetic distinctions between English (L<sub>2</sub>) and Balochi (L<sub>1</sub>), emphasizing the ways in which the former influences at the phonological difficulties in English consonants in Balochi-speaking students at Sardar Bahadur Khan Women University (SBKWU), Quetta. The study makes use of Kirkpatrick's (2010) *Lingua Franca as a Multilingual Model*, which promotes teaching English in a way that enhances rather than detracts from regional languages. The qualitative study centers how much L<sub>1</sub> interference impacts Balochi speakers' ability to communicate and learn in English, as well as how these pronunciation issues effect their fluency and intelligibility. According to the study, the influence of Balochi phonology causes recurrent problems with articulating specific English consonants. The findings suggest that language education methods can be enhanced by a greater comprehension of L<sub>1</sub>-L<sub>2</sub> interaction.

▪ p-ISSN: 2663-3299

▪ e-ISSN: 2663-3841

▪ L-ISSN: 2663-3299

**Key Words:** Phonology, Balochi Language, Speaking Proficiency, Cross Language Communication

## Introduction

As the official language of Pakistan and its lingua franca, English is also used as the medium of instruction in higher education. Proficiency and cognition in English language skills are essential at the university level, particularly in English Master's and Bachelor's degrees. Sardar Bahadur Khan Women University (SBKWU) attracts Baloch students from different parts of Balochistan. There are three primary regional interior groupings within the Baloch race, which can be referred to as:

1. Baloch Sulaimani
2. The Makurani Baloch,
3. Rakhshani Baloch (Panhwar, 2008)

Since the Baloch people are naturally nomadic, the Balochi language has been affected by the languages of the surrounding settled races, including Sanskrit, Avesta, Old Persian, Sindhi, Jatki, Turkish, and Pahlavi (Ali, Baloch & Ahmad, 2011). As a result, these Balochi learners speak a range of Baloch dialects. As a result, Balochi speakers who begin studying English as a second language encounter difficulties, particularly with pronunciation. Their native language's

sounds and pronunciation are frequently disrupted by the L1 effect, which causes them to pronounce some English words differently and produces a variant form of English phonology. like /w/, /e/, /a/. the pattern and variation of sound knowledge make it difficult for L2 learners. Moreover, learners of L2 phonology are influenced by L1 pronunciation which interferes in the production of L2 sounds. The relationship of L1 sounds with L2 leads to the mispronunciation and emergence of a new sound instead of the actual one (Jarvis & Pavlenko, 2008). In addition, Guiora (2006) concluded that second language acquisition is often hurdled by the accurate phonology production for L2 learners because a) Specific sounds are not present in speakers' L1, making them unable to obtain the pronunciation of L2 sounds accurately, b) Similarity exists in some sounds in L1 and L2 but they still are unable to produce proper pronunciation in usage, c) The similar sounds are present in both L1 and L2, but learners lack the capability to use and place them in L2 sounds. Therefore, it is a clear indication that distinct sounds of languages create trouble for native speakers to learn accurately.

However, certain L2 sounds are absent from the speakers' native speech. According to Ellis (1994), this deficit causes L1 speakers to make mistakes when producing L2 speech sounds. According to Bartelt (1992), there are differences in vocabulary and sound generation between languages. According to a similar viewpoint, every language has unique vocabulary and phonetic patterns (Yang & Xu, 2001). On the one hand, linguists such as Krashan (2003) dispute the idea that L1 interferes with L2, claiming that phonetics and phonology are the areas most impacted while learning L2 since L1 vowels and consonants interfere with second language acquisition. Whereas, other linguists such as Nation (2003) insist on not neglecting the first language while learning a second

language, as speakers are emotionally affiliated to their L1. Moreover, according to the study of Sankoff (2001), language changes as a result of people moving around for a variety of causes. Weinreich (1968), cited by Trudgill (1988), believed that interference and the borrowing of elements and influences from one language to another is the cause of general language change. Convergence is an additional aspect. Trudgill (1988) defined conferring as a phonological type of acceptance. The primary cause of incorrect pronunciation is the interaction between the first and second languages when speaking or engaging in them. Indeed, second language learners adhere to the principle of generating sounds from their mother tongue and employing those same sounds in their second language. It will be difficult to pronounce a sound if it does not exist in any first language. For example, in Sindhi there is a sound /ŋ/, in Sindhi /ɹ/. That is why; Sindhi speakers can pronounce it easily rather than Punjabi, Urdu, Balochi, and other first language speakers (Ansari et al., 2016).

Hence, the phonemes of the Balochi language differ significantly from those of modern Persian and Old Persian. However, the Balochi language exhibits phonetic similarities with Sanskrit, according to Professor Khalil Saddiqui (2001). Therefore, there are several effects of surrounding languages in the Balochi vocabulary and historical phonology (Korn, 2005).

### Statement Problem

Balochi speakers originally from the province of Balochistan frequently encounter particular difficulties while learning how to pronounce words in English accurately. Due to the notable distinctions between the phonological systems of American and Pakistani English and their own, L1 Learners can cause accent variance, make it harder to pronounce words correctly, and even impede clear communication through a variety of

educational assets, media, and interactions. Therefore the study explores the reasons for speaking proficiency among Balochi speakers and its impact on their educational outcomes.

## Research Objectives

- To explore the influence of L<sub>1</sub> (Balochi) on L<sub>2</sub> (English) of the Balochi language speakers on their performance in ESL Classroom
- To examine social reasons for variant pronunciation of some words of English that is L<sub>2</sub> for Balochi speakers

## Research Questions

1. What is the influence of L<sub>1</sub> (Balochi) on L<sub>2</sub> (English) of the Balochi language speakers on their performance in ESL Classrooms?
2. What are the social reasons for the variant pronunciation of some words of English that is L<sub>2</sub> for Balochi speakers?

## Significance of Study

The current study assists in identifying the phonological areas of speech that contribute to Balochi learners' incorrect pronunciation of English and makes recommendations for future retraining and advancement toward improving proficiency in speaking. Some phonemes that the Baloch students pronounce differently are the focus of the investigation. In Baloch script, several phonemes are lacking, while few phonemes are absent in English script. Through the lens of L<sub>1</sub> and geographic impacts on the phonology of the English language, the study examined how Baloch learners articulated absent phonemes in both English and Balochi.

## Literature Review

English must continue to be a vital national

language since it is a modern language that is the primary means of knowledge acquisition, entry into international markets, and communication (Khalique, 2014). English remained Pakistan's official language following its independence from British colonization because the government saw it as a potential compromise language (Haque, 1982). According to Mahboob (2003), Pakistan is a multilingual nation with at least 69 active languages.

Furthermore, the study of Rahman (1990) discussed the trait with regard to Pushto speakers (ibid.). He provides the following example to support his claim that Pushto speakers do not articulate the letter [v] in word-ending positions: In certain instances, Pushto's influence also eliminates [v], according to LOVE [lou] Rahman (p. 19). Both the native speakers and Pakistani English speakers differ phonologically from one another. Second-language learners actually follow the convention of producing the sounds of their first language and using those identical sounds in their second language. It will be difficult to pronounce a sound in any first language if there isn't one. For instance, the sounds /ŋ/ and /ɹ/ in Sindhi are present. According to Ansari et al. (2016), Sindhi speakers are therefore more likely to pronounce it correctly than speakers of Punjabi, Urdu, Balochi, and other first languages. Similarly, Siegel (1985), as quoted in Chambers & Schilling (2013), addressed the influence of Sindhi, Persian, and the local variant of English on Balochi, as well as the merger of Afghani Pashto and Urdu evolving into a new Pashto dialect spoken in Pakistan.

Furthermore, Gass and Selinker (1994) assert that mother tongue influence is recognized in language transfer. On the other hand, according to Roach (2000), there are numerous accents and dialects for a single language since speakers come from a variety of socioeconomic classes, ages, and geographic and cultural origins, which affects how the language is spoken. Moreover, Swan

and Smith (2001) offered a teacher's guide addressing phonological issues with students from twenty-three different language backgrounds in the hopes that teachers would be better able to comprehend the issues raised by their students by drawing comparisons between English and related structures in their native tongues.

Additionally, Sankoff (2001) believes that language changes as a result of individuals moving around for a variety of causes. Balochi bears a great deal of phonetic resemblance to Old Persian but also several phonetic distinctions with modern Persian. The Balochi language exhibits phonetic similarities with Sanskrit, according to Professor Saddiqui (2001). There are several effects of surrounding languages on the Balochi vocabulary and historical phonology (Korn, 2005).

After researching the issue of change, Talaat (2002) came to the conclusion that Pakistani English was not a stable system. He concentrated on the English variation process. The way that English is used in Pakistan differs greatly from that of native speakers. The interaction between English and other indigenous languages in Pakistan, such as Sindhi, Punjabi, Urdu, Balochi, Siraiki, and others, is the cause influencing English in that country. Additionally, Mahboob (2003) examined the cultural dimension of Pakistani English and the relationship between Islam and English in Pakistani culture. He came to the conclusion that Pakistanis' use of English reflects their religious aspects which is the primary cultural tradition in the country. Rahman (1990) further argued in his book Pakistani English, which characterized the English spoken by non-native speakers. He also discussed the differences between Pakistani English and Standard English grammar structures. Rahman finds differences in morphology, syntax, and grammar.

## Research Methodology

---

## Design

The study conducted an exploratory investigation and used a qualitative form of inquiry. By analyzing the phonemes of the two languages, the researcher employed comparative research in this study. According to Rokkan (1968) (quoted in Hakim, 2012), comparative research tries to show language configurations from a common forerunner and is associated with language comparisons. Following seven years of continuous academic engagement with the students, the researcher was able to evaluate phonemes that the Baloch English-speaking students found challenging to pronounce in their daily routines.

---

## Participants for Study

The proposed research selected a convenience sample of 50 Baloch English speaking students, aging 20-24 years, of SBK Women's University, English Department.

---

## Instrumentation

The researcher used Dawn Editorial (novermber,2022), which the Baloch English speakers find difficult to read and pronounce common daily routine words from it. The troublesome letters appear in the words at the beginning. The participants' statements were captured on tape, written down, and examined using contrastive analysis. According to Zhang (2009), who referenced Lincoln (1985), comparative analysis is used to analyze phonological statements in order to find patterns in the data of two languages that allow for an easy comparison.

---

## Data Analysis

Employing the contrastive analysis, the results are depicted in diagrams. One column showed the words from an article, the other displayed standard American transcription and the last displayed the utterances of the participants analyzing the problematic

utterances either from social or regional variations.

### Data Analysis

Dawn's editorial piece for reading (see

appendix) was recorded while being uttered by the participants. The English words consisting sounds /k/, /e/, /a/, and /g/ The English-zed words of native lexis and letters in Balochi Script which are absent in the English script (Shahwani, [1998](#), p. 147).

**Table 1**

Words	Phonetics Transcription	Phonological variation Balochi Speaks
Development	dɪ'vɛləpmənt	Davalopment
discrimination	dɪ'skrɪmɪ'neɪʃn	descrimination
Daughters	dɔ:təz	Daughtars
Khan	kɑ:n	Qaan
reaffirmed	,ri:ə'fɜ:md	Raffimed
textbooks	tɛkstbʊks	Taxtbooks

The above diagram shows that the letter K is sounded as /q/, and /e/ is sounded as /a/

**Table 2**

Words	Phonetics Transcription	Phonological variation Balochi Speaks
gender	dʒɛndər	Gandar
discrimination	dɪ'skrɪmə'neɪʃən	Discrimination
Women	wɪmən	Voman
Development	dɪ'vɛləpmənt	Davalopment
aspirations	æspə'reɪʃənz	Aspiration

The letter E is sounded as /a/ in the utterance of /E/ words.

**Table 3**

Words	Phonetics Transcription	Phonological variation Balochi Speaks
Secular	sɛkjələr	Saculer
Created	kri'eɪtəd	Crated
Women	'wɪmən	Voman
Enhanced	ɛn'hænst	Anhansed
Development	dɪ'vɛləpmənt	Davalopment
University	,junə'vɜ:səti	Unsitey

The variation is seen in utterances of letters /r/, /e/, /a/,

**Table 4**

Words	Phonetics Transcription	Phonological variation Balochi Speakers
Secular	sɛkjələɾ	Sacular
recognised	rɛkəg, naɪzd	Ragocnised
Women	wimən	Voman
Development	dɪ'vɛləpmənt	Davalopment
Legacy	'lɛgəsi	Legacy

The above diagram shows that /e/ is phonologically uttered as /a/. Whereas, /w/ as uttered /o/ long vowel sound. That is common in every participant consciously.

The above-mentioned phonemes are found problematic in utterance by the Baloch

English speakers and the comparative analysis showed a glaring contrast in pronunciation. Similar results are shown by the three groups in above mentioned phonemes.

**Table 5**

Words	Phonetics Transcription	Phonological variation Balochi Speakers
models	'madəlz	Madals
dimension	dɪ'mɛnʃən	Demansion
women	wimən	Voman
University	junə'vɜrsəti	Unsitey
Khan	kɑ:n	Qaan
Development	dɪ'vɛləpmənt	Davalopmet

However, the words starting with /k/, /e/, /a/, and /g/, letters in Balochi Script are different and voiceless. The Sulaimani and Rakhshani groups were found closer to the Pakistani pronunciation of these letters. The Makurani group was found to pronounce these phonemes almost similar to phonology.

## Discussion

Due to the difficulty of English spelling, phoneme-based learning of pronunciation is more necessary than memorizing alphabetic letters (Roach 2000). Findings show that L1's influence on L2 is responsible for the overlap of phonetics in A, E, H, P, and F. However, native Balochi sounds that have the same location but a distinct pronunciation style is used to replace the target sounds. Certain English phonemes, such as /a/ and /h/, have

different pronunciations because the participants cannot tell the difference between them despite their resemblance. According to the findings of Afghani's 1960 research reports some phonemes in native Pashto script such as /f/ are absent, leading people to mistake it for /p/. Because the two phonemes are similar, they are unable to differentiate between them, which results in mispronouncing English phonemes. This situation also exists in the Baloch language script. Shahwani (1998) noted that Balochi English speakers pronounce the Balochi letters, which are not present in English script, differently. Individuals from the inner Sulaimani and Rakhshani mountains were found to be able to pronounce words starting with /K/ and /w/ in Pakistani phonology. However, Rehman (2014) offers a significant reason for this discovery. These phonemes



are audible being said by the Makurani range participants. Baluch (1984) provided a valid reason for this when he said that Makurani natives are more exposed. According to Hashmi (2000), Makurani Baloch English speakers believe that continual exposure to foreign languages has caused them to lose the authenticity and purity of their original tongue. In contrast as Baloch (2005) also asserts, the Makurani native language has altered, in contrast to the Balochi of the other two regional groups. In contrast to Rakhshani and Sulaimani people, whose L1 is considered pure and aids in the utterance of khay and ghain, the 11th and 25th letters in Balochi Script, which are spoken in an English dialect that is similar to that of Pakistan, this allows for the utterance of /k/, /e/, /a/, and /g/. It is therefore clear that Baloch speakers pronounce the phonemes /w/, /k/, /e/, /a/, and /g/ differently than Pakistanis. Voiceless velar stop /q/ takes the place of voiced glottal/velar stop /g/. Likewise, voiceless velar stop /o/ takes the role of voiced glottal/velar stop /w/.

## Conclusion

The study comes to the clear conclusion that speaking a foreign language causes phonological changes because of interference and effect from the L1. However, there may be barriers to having a smooth conversation and communication issues as a result of this pronunciation discrepancy. The study's primary focus was on the phonological variations in English speech among Baloch students, and it deciphered these variations for future research. Researchers have discovered that Baloch students who reside in more communally engaged, socially interactive areas with diversity in interactions and other groups are less likely to produce more phonological differences than students who live in socially and culturally isolated, limited social interaction areas. Therefore, the participants who speak English from Makurani have a lower phonological

difference than those who speak English from Sulaimani and Rakhshani. Therefore, compared to a regional area that is isolated and aloof in its social and cultural connection and communication with other language groups, the social and cultural variance within any regional group and area may result in a greater scope of amendment and transformation.

The study would broaden understanding and assist linguists and Baloch speakers in identifying English sounds pronounced differently. In addition to societal and regional factors that cause some English phonemes to be pronounced differently, the L1 influence hinders the speech of Baloch English speakers. Because of their greater exposure and adaptable adoption language habits, Makurani English-speaking participants are observed to create a broader phonological difference than Sulaimani and Rakhshani. The pronunciation of the phonemes /A/, /H/, /F/, and /P/ varies throughout the regional groupings. However, the Rakhshani and Sulaimani groups, as well as the Makurani regional group, pronounce the words beginning with /k/, /e/, /a/, and /g/ with a Pakistani accent. The Makurani group appears to be more affected by the regional effect and the influence of L1 on L2.

Because of this, interaction with other language groups and the influence of L1 on L2 have a greater phonological difference in Makurani English speaking individuals than in Sulaimani and Rakhshani. The Makurani people are, as Hashmi (2000) accurately noted, receptive to new experiences and have a flexible adoptive language habit that contributes to language progress.

Thus, it is concluded that Learning a second language is influenced by a wide range of general characteristics, including age, aptitude, IQ, cognitive style, attitudes, motivation, and personality. It would be quite challenging to take into account every factor associated with learning a second or foreign language at the same time. The

current study recommended that language is for communication purposes therefore, it should exhibit the same propensity to be unable to discriminate between similar sounds and to change the way that L1 influences their L2 phonological dialects. The

speaking proficiency required a friendly environment for learning and teaching target languages. However, indigenous languages have a significant contribution to learning effectively today.



## References

- Ansari, S., Buriro, G. A., & Mallah, G. M. (2016). Phonological differentiation between Pakistani English and British English: Analysis of Sindhi speakers, cognitive management of received pronunciation. *Grassroots*, 50(2). <https://sujo.usindh.edu.pk/index.php/Grassroots/article/view/1833>
- Baloch, A. H., Baloch, S. A., & Ahmad, B. (2011). An old phonological study of new Persian and Balochi. *ResearchGate*. [https://www.researchgate.net/publication/264276260\\_An\\_Old\\_Phonological\\_Study\\_of\\_Balochi\\_and\\_Persian](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/264276260_An_Old_Phonological_Study_of_Balochi_and_Persian)
- Baloch, A. Q. (2005). *Balochi Bamia* (2nd ed.). Balochi Academy.
- Baluch, M. S. Khan. (1984). *Literary history of the Balochis*. Balochi Academy.
- Ellis, R. (1994). *Principles of instructed language learning*. <https://www.asian-efl-journal.com/main-editions-new/principles-of-instructed-language-learning/index.htm>
- Haque, A. R. (1982). THE POSITION AND STATUS OF ENGLISH IN PAKISTAN. *World Englishes*, 2(1), 6–9. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-971X.1982.tb00510.x>
- Hashmi, Z. S. (2000). *Sayad Ganj*. Sayed Hashmi Academy.
- Khalique, H. (2014). Pakistan: The question of identity (Vol. 2, Issue 5).
- Kirkpatrick, A. (2006). Which model of English: Native-speaker, nativized, or? *English in the world: Global rules, global roles*, 71.
- Korn, A. (2005). *Towards a historical grammar of Balochi: Studies in Balochi historical phonology and vocabulary* (Doctoral dissertation, Université de Francfort). <https://hal.science/tel-02452292/file/Korn2003thesis.pdf>
- Mahboob, A. (2003). The English language in Pakistan: A brief overview of its history and linguistics. *Pakistan Journal of Language*, 4(1). [https://www.academia.edu/816229/The\\_English\\_language\\_in\\_Pakistan\\_a\\_brief\\_overview\\_of\\_its\\_history\\_and\\_linguistics](https://www.academia.edu/816229/The_English_language_in_Pakistan_a_brief_overview_of_its_history_and_linguistics)
- Rahman, T. (1990). Pakistani English. In *The Handbook of Asian Englishes* (pp. 279–296). <https://doi.org/10.1002/9781118791882.ch11>
- Sankoff, G., & Wagner, S. E. (2001). Age-grading in retrograde movement: The inflected future in Montréal French. *University of Pennsylvania Working Papers in Linguistics*, 12(2), 16. [https://www.researchgate.net/publication/242318968\\_Age-grading\\_in\\_retrograde\\_movement\\_The\\_inflected\\_future\\_in\\_Montreal\\_French](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/242318968_Age-grading_in_retrograde_movement_The_inflected_future_in_Montreal_French)
- Shahwani, A. A. Q. (1998). *Balochi Zaban o Adab*. Kallat Publishers. <https://ebook.balochiacademy.org/ebooks/balochi-zuban-o-adab>
- Swan, M., & Smith, B. (2001). Learner English: A teacher's guide to interference and other problems. *Modern Language Journal*, 72(4), 461. <http://dx.doi.org/10.2307/327766>
- Trudgill, P. (1988). *Dialects in contact*. Basil Blackwell.
- Yang, X. M., & Xu, H. (2001). *Errors of creativity: An analysis of lexical errors committed by Chinese ESL students*. University Press of America.

## Appendix A

---

### DAWN

#### Today's Newspaper

#### Education For All?

Anjum Altaf Published September 16, 2022

PAKISTAN is a signatory to the UN Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), one of which obligates the country to provide inclusive and equitable education for all. Once again, the question has been asked: is Pakistan moving towards that goal?

An inclusive education does not discriminate by gender, language, religion, etc. On gender, discrimination is manifest at the outset when income-constrained families spend more to educate sons than daughters. The bias is reaffirmed when textbooks offer limited role models for girls in schools and Universities. It is argued that Pakistan is a socially conservative country and most women subscribe to the models prescribed for them. This is an assertion made by men speaking on behalf of women who have not been independently asked or consulted. Even if this is conceded, we know that there is a subset of women with different aspirations. At the very least, the Pakistani curriculum has no place for them, reportedly not even for someone as culturally acceptable as Malala Yousafzai. It remains an open question whether it is right to exclude them and who is to make that determination. Imran Khan stressed the issue previously.

There is a forgotten dimension to this discrimination. People who are old enough remember a time in the 1960s when girls in cities commonly cycled to their schools and colleges. No more. Once again, it is argued that this was an inappropriate legacy of British rule that has been rightly done away with. School education reaffirms such limitations on the choices of women without much public debate.

On language, the discrimination is more subtle. Children whose home language is not English or Urdu cannot acquire elementary education in their own language even if their parents want, despite the global consensus supporting its advantages. Outside of Sindh, this aspect is neither fully recognized nor debated. The exclusion of such languages means not only their slow death but also the withering of their associated cultures and identities.

*The writer is the author of What We Get Wrong About Education in Pakistan (Folio Books 2022) and Pakistan ka Matlab Kya (Aks Publications 2022).*

*Published in Dawn, September 16th, 2022*

## Appendix B

---

The list of 20 words:

Aid	Hair	Fine	Peep	Khan
Air	Hate	Fry	Pen	Ghani
Arm	Farm	Pen	Khaddar	Ghastly
Hall	Far	Pay	Khaki	Ghana