

# Foreign Policy of Pakistan: A Case Study of Z.A. Bhutto's Policies Post 1971 Tragedy

#### \* Rimsha Farooq

\* Graduate, International Relations, COMSATS University, Islamabad, Pakistan

Abstract: Zulfikar Ali Bhutto ascended to Power when Pakistan was bleeding after the horrors of the 1971 disaster. "Rotti, kapra, makaan" was also based on this concept. Zulfikar Ali Bhutto came into power to provide equality and to make Pakistan a democratic state, where every citizen is treated equally. Zulfikar Ali Bhutto had some great achievements during his regime which include the Shimla agreement, nuclear power, and the 1973 constitution. However, his trust in Zia-Ul-Haq was the major factor in his fall from power. This paper focuses on Bhutto as a ruler, his achievements, his reforms, and his fall from power.

**Key Words:** Zulfikar Ali Bhutto, Nationalization, Constitution, Power, Achievements, Down Fall, Reforms, Religion, Opposition Parties

#### Introduction

Zulfikar Ali Bhutto along with his party Pakistan People's Party (PPP), with its renowned slogan "roti, kapra, makaan" (food, cloth, shelter) came into power as the Prime Minister of Pakistan, after the disasters of 1971, when Pakistan was divided, facing challenges and cross-border tensions with India. The PPP's main motives were: Islam is our Faith, Democracy is our Policy, and Socialism is our Economy. When Zulfikar Ali Bhutto rose into power the country was facing huge economic corrosion and was in its critical phase. Now let's discuss how Bhutto formed his political party and came into power. After the war of 1965 when Ayub Khan was in power he was not in favor of Western democracy for his nation. At that time Z.A. Bhutto became the blue-eyed man of Ayub Khan because Bhutto was considered a very intelligent man. He was young and had the best solutions for problems. Ayub Khan heavily relied on Bhutto for foreign affairs issues. Because of this Bhutto had a great influence over the President of Pakistan. During that time some of the people thought of Bhutto as an Indian agent because some of his land was on the side of India. Bhutto proved them wrong and left the land and his property and appeared as anti-Indian during

the 1960s. Bhutto was at that time the Foreign Minister of Pakistan and the army chief was General Musa. Ayub Khan because of his busy schedule gave the responsibility of army affairs to Musa and likewise foreign affairs to Bhutto. Due to Bhutto's influence in the country, he became close to General Musa and convinced Musa and the army junta to wage war against India and get back to Kashmir. Together they launched Operation Gibraltar in Kashmir in early 1965 (<u>Hassan</u>, 2010). The purpose of the operation was to give tough time to Indians. Ayub Khan was not aware of this operation and as a result, India struck back. Pakistan could not resist more and also the armory and ammunition were running low. Ayub Khan came to find out much later and was surprised. He wanted help from the West but they refused. He saw his army could not resist more so he asked Russia for help and Kosygin agreed and managed to have a peace treaty between India and Pakistan in Moscow. Ayub Khan signed the treaty peace was made and war was settled (Ali, 2001).

Bhutto angry and furious launched a campaign against Ayub Khan and said that he had betrayed the Pakistani people by giving the territory held by the Pakistani army. So in a result and against

**p- ISSN:** 2788-502X

e-ISSN: 2788-5038

LISSN:

URL: <a href="http://dx.doi.org/10.31703/gfpr.2021(IV-I).06">http://dx.doi.org/10.31703/gfpr.2021(IV-I).06</a>

Ayub Khan, Z.A Bhutto launched his own political party known as the Pakistan People's Party (PPP). Bhutto wanted to have an alliance with Mujibur Rehman in East Pakistan, but Mujibhas other ideas in mind. Z.A. Bhutto was very famous among the youth of Pakistan at that time because of his charismatic personality and his involvement in foreign issues and the army. Bhutto became so anit-Ayub that he began to have political activities that were against the constitution of 1965. Ayub Khan put him and other leaders in jail and later released them. Ayub Khan wanted to resolve the issue of Political crisis and asked once again for help from Bhutto on the issue but Bhutto refused it and resisted. Ayub Khan when failed to control resistance resigned from power and Yahya Khan the chief of army staff imposed martial law and came into power hence the constitution of 1962 was abrogated. At that time Mujib already gave his six points focused on: we need to have independence, we need to have financial powers and independence should be given to the provinces. West Pakistan did not accept the six points. During that time three major cyclones hit East Pakistan causing a lot of damage and killing thousands of people. In these situations, elections were held and Sheikh Mujibur Rehman won a majority in East Pakistan and Bhutto in West Pakistan. Bhutto did not accept the results of the elections and wanted to install a single government or to work in groups. Yahya Khan announced the conference of the National Assembly, but right before the conference, Bhutto imposed a lot of pressure on Yahya, and the conference was canceled. The sentiments of the people of East Pakistan arose and there began violence. Bhutto, Gen. Tikka, and Gen. Ahsan put pressure on Yahya Khan for military operations in East Pakistan. Military action known as "Operation Searchlight" killed thousands and thousands of women were raped. A lot of refugees fled to India. India took advantage of this situation and intervened in the crisis and a proper war started between India and Pakistan in 1971. India took advantage of the weakness of Pakistan and gave refugees to people. Ultimately Pakistan had to surrender and Bangladesh came into existence. The genocide of

1971 has three important players involved: Yahya Khan, Zulfikar Ali Bhutto, and Sheikh MujiburRahman (Zaidi, 2019).

# Creation of PPP (Pakistan People's Party)

Zulfikar Ali Bhutto launched his own political party known as the Pakistan Peoples Party, which was focused on four basic agendas:

- Religion- Islam
- Democracy in Pakistan
- Nationalization
- Power (Ali, 2001)

#### Bhutto in Power

After the horrors of 1971 and the huge defeat Pakistan suffered Zulfikar Ali Bhutto came into government as the first Civil Chief Martial Law Administrator with his aim to pick up the broken pieces of Pakistan. Bhutto's policies were based on the nationalization of industries and financial institutes. The main focus of Bhutto's early campaign was on poor class and labor rights and that is how his famous slogan roti, kapra, makaan (food, cloth, shelter) was introduced. Zulfikar Ali Bhutto during his campaigns promised to have Islamic values, social justice, democracy (people's government), and equal rights of laborers and the poor class to be the prime agenda of the Pakistan People's Party. Another major aim of his policies was to bring back home the soldiers India had caught during the Indo-Pak War of 1971. Zulfikar Ali Bhutto came into power when Pakistan was facing a huge loss and people were morally damaged and lost. It was a great challenge for his government and his aims were to morally support his people, give them support, bring back their confidence, and change policies and constitution. Immediately after being in power Bhutto addressed with nation through radio and television comforted them with his words assured them that his policies would be for the people of Pakistan, and promised to restore democracy in Pakistan. He further addressed how he wanted to end the suffering of Pakistani people and wanted to see Pakistan thrive. He further focused on rebuilding the institutions that had been destroyed by previous rulers. Bhutto promised to derive policies that would be more focused on the common man and his rights and also to eliminate corruption. He elevated the sanction on the National Awami Party (NAP) and wanted to start forming a clean slate (Zaidi, 2019).

# Zulfikar Ali Bhutto's Regime Reforms and Challenges

Zulfikar Ali Bhutto after coming into power had to face a lot of issues Pakistan was dealing with at that time. Some of the major issues on the agenda were:

- The return of prisoners of war and civilians.
- The making of a new constitution for Pakistan.
- Recognition of Bangladesh.
- The Nationalization of Industries.
- Giving Religion is a key factor in making policies of Pakistan (<u>Hassan</u>, 2010).

#### 1973 Constitution

Pakistan was the victim of hurdles and disappointments after the liberation Bangladesh and there were also constitutional issues. Zulfikar Ali Bhutto after coming into power in 1971 discussed his priorities. His first task after coming into power was giving the Nation a new constitution. Bhutto's key reforms apart from nationalization and socialization were giving Pakistan a constitution that was based on democracy. After two years of struggle, through voting and gaining 125 from 135 votes, the very first democratic constitution came into effect on 1973, August 14, making Bhutto the very first democratically elected Prime Minister. The constitution suggests a parliamentary form of government. The constitution was Islamic. Some of the key features of the 1973 constitution were:

- Pakistan was given the title of "Islamic Republic of Pakistan".
- 2. A federal system was introduced in the country.
- 3. The parliamentary form of Government gives the PM of Pakistan every power and makes the president very weak. It was said that whatever decision the President made

- it has to be checked by PM also. Without his consensus, no order will be imposed.
- 4. Fundamental rights were given to the people of Pakistan.
- 5. Independent Judiciary was given under this constitution, and under this constitution, Bhutto became very powerful.
- Islamic provisions are provided in the principle of policy, which means the principles are not binding, they are just to give ideas to the state.
- 7. Pakistan as a Democratic State
- 3. The national language was declared Urdu and English was the official language.
- 9. Bicameralism was introduced, which means there will be two houses of Parliament, the Senate and the National Assembly (Zaidi, 2017).

There were principles in the constitution that ensured that the country was run on an Islamic system. According to the constitution, Pakistan is a democratic state which means the government is elected by the citizens of the Nation. A government which is for the people and by the people. Basic rights were given to citizens of Pakistan under this constitution. Some of these are freedom of speech, movement, assembly, association, business, speech, recognize religion, citizens being given equality, the right to grasp property anywhere in the country, and security, and protection against slavery and forced labor. The constitution of 1973 recommends a parliamentary form of Government, where the Prime Minister is given broad powers as compared to the President. The Prime Minister is the head of the Parliamentary system (Hassan, 2010).

Bhutto made seven alterations to the constitution in a short duration of time. The first of the seven was regarding Bangladesh. It was related to the acknowledgment of Bangladesh as a separate nation. At the time when the 1973 constitution was made the issue of the recognition of Bangladesh was not resolved. So it was a necessity to recognize Bangladesh as a separate nation and include this recognition in the clause. So article 1 was changed and there was no chance

of East Pakistan merging with West Pakistan (Zaidi, 2017).

The second alteration in the constitution was related to the recognition of Ahmadis as non-Muslims. The movement against Ahmadies was first started in 1950 in Pakistan, leading towards martial law in Lahore in 1953. The same type of movement started during Bhutto's government in 1970 and led to severe clashes between students and Ahmadies at Rabwa Railway Station. This severe situation catches the eyes of the public through news causing the meetings of political parties such as Jamate-Islami, jamatulema-e-islam, etc. These parties demand the declaration of Ahmadis as non-Muslims. Under this situation, Bhutto called a meeting with the National Assembly and talked about the issue. After meetings, the National Assembly passed the second amendment bill in the constitution. According to this amendment third clause was added in Article 260, which clearly states who is a true Muslim. According to the clause: "A person who claims to be a Prophet and does not believe in Muhammad (SAW) as a last Prophet, such type of person is not a Muslim" (Bhurgri, 2002).

The third amendment was made in 1975. This amendment was related to the imprisonment of the opposition. It increased the power of the government by giving them the right to keep the opposition in custody for unlimited time if they were involved in some kind of criminal/illegal activity. During the time from 1974-1975, Bhutto's government was seen to be authoritative and biased. He wanted to punish his opponents. The opponents were given no such freedom in this regard. The court was also on the side of the government causing more problems opponents (Syed, 1992).

The fourth amendment was made in 1975. The aim of this amendment was to limit the role of jurisdiction. It limits the powers of the High Court, by depriving them of yielding any bail to the favor. This amendment made the High Court helpless and powerless. Due to this amendment, High Courts were unable to provide favors and bail to political victims. This amendment allows minorities to have 6 special seats in the National

Assembly and also increases seats from three to five in the Punjab Assembly. First, the opposition was against this amendment and wanted to discuss its advantages and disadvantages but the government did not allow the. Hence the amendment was pass

during the absence of opposition (Bhurgri, 2002).

The fifth amendment was made in 1956. The aim of this amendment was to provide more restrictions to the judiciary and to reduce the infringe of the judiciary into an executive circle. Basically, this amendment applies more limitations on jurisdiction. This amendment provides that there should be separate high courts in Sindh and Balochistan. Bhutto's main purpose in passing the Fifth Amendment was that, no organ of the state, whether its legislature jurisdiction or executive should interfere in each other's sphere.

The Sixth Amendment was made in 1977 before the fall of Bhutto's government. This amendment was made to provide wider favors to Chief Justices. This amendment was made for the extension of the Chief Justice's terms beyond the age of retirement. This amendment states that the age of retirement of Supreme Court Chief Justice is 65 years and the age of retirement of High Court Chief Justice is 62 years who have not completed their term, will continue to hold their positions in office until the completion of the term (Syed, 1992).

The seventh amendment was also made in 1977. This amendment allows the Prime Minister of Pakistan to hold a referendum. Because PPP and PNA were not on one page (that is there was a deadlock between them) Bhutto decided to propose a solution in the form of a referendum. Under this amendment if PM fails to get the majority of votes he will have to resign from office (Bhurgri, 2002).

# Policy Reforms

#### Educational and Health Reform

Education was also seen as a major part of Bhutto's policies, which promoted the importance of Education, science, and technology. For example; it was in his regime that many of the medical colleges were established to empower education related to health. Bhutto during his regime focused on many health reforms as well. For example; writing proper prescriptions was declared important for every doctor. It became compulsory for every doctor to give a proper written prescription to patients. Educational and Health reforms during his regime were some of the great steps that he took in order to make Pakistan prosper. Educational institutes like schools, colleges, and universities were nationalized throughout the country. A commission was formed in order to provide aid to universities and higher education systems, by providing all the possible aid to educational institutions they need in order to facilitate universities and other education systems. It was during Bhutto's regime that basic education was made free of cost to the common man who could not afford it (Bukhari et al., 2020).

### **Industrial Reforms**

As Bhutto promised the nationalization of industries during his election statement for the benefit of the labor class, immediately after joining the government he announced the nationalization of industries. At first, the party's document announced the nationalization of basic industries, insurance, and banking. Later on 2, 1972, he announced Ianuary the nationalization of 34 industries under 10 categories. These categories were: iron and steel, metal, engineering, electrical industries, motor vehicles manufacturing industries, manufacture and assembling, cement industries, industries of public utility, gas and oil, and heavy and basic chemicals. Only some of the industries were allowed to work privately, rest were given under government possession. Bhutto took the step of nationalization industries so that the common man could have benefits and stop the absorption of the nation's wealth in the hands of a few dominant moguls. This policy was looked after by the BIM Board of Industrial Management. The benefit of this policy was that it took power from the ruling class and gave authority to management to introduce policies that were beneficial for the working class. Bhutto did not nationalize the industries of the remaining category, because he wanted to maintain equality between the public and private sectors. He ordered the workers to work effectively in order to increase production in industries and make them prosperous. After making the announcement public of the nationalization of industries only management was nationalized, ownership was not nationalized.

Soon after the nationalization of 34 industries under 10 categories, Bhutto announced that there would be no more nationalization of industries. But he did not keep the promise he made of no more nationalization of industries. In 1973, his government also took over the ghee, rice, and cotton industries. There were a number of industries that were nationalized during 1973-1976 like in 1974 private banks were nationalized. Similarly, in 1976, more than two thousand rice, wheat, and cotton gins were detained. Due to the nationalization of the rice, wheat, and cotton industries level investments were reduced. This approval did not involve the whole cabinet, only some of the bureaucrats were involved and the rest of the cabinet was ignored. A number of businessmen and industrialists were affected by this decision. Industrialization has a huge turn on the economy. Was it successful or not? The nationalization of industries proved to be ineffective because at first these industries were controlled by people who had interests and knowledge related to their work, but the government appointees and new management could not work as effectively (Coll, 2004).

#### Land Reforms

At first, during the era of Ayub Khan and Yahya Khan the power of controlling the economy of Pakistan was in the hands of twenty-two families. Policies related to land and agriculture were changed during Bhutto's regime. Some of the policies were introduced during the Ayub Khan regime in 1959. He imposed ceilings of 500 acres of irrigated land and 1000 acres of unirrigated land. Bhutto in his 1972 speech wanted to change these policies in favor of landless peasants and

tenants. He later in his speech with his citizens announced the change in these policies and announced to lower the ceiling from 500 to 150 acres of irrigated land and from 1000 to 300 acres of unirrigated land. He changed other policies like changing the water rate, announcing the equal distribution of cost between landlords and tenants, and taxes were also changed. With his famous slogan "roti, kapra, makaan", Bhutto was more focused on the needs of the labor class giving them benefits they never received before. It was during his tenure that people with less than 12 acres of land were allowed to not pay any kind of tax. It was during his regime that a pattern was adopted to give laborers monthly salaries. He also ordered the retrieval of lands that were unlawfully occupied by the powerful sardars and feudal, especially in Baluchistan. He also ordered the repossession of land from landowners without giving them any compensation and to be distributed to landless peasants free of cost. Bhutto in his speech talked about the reason behind land reforms. He wanted to end the unjust and immoral system under which the citizens of Pakistan especially poor people have suffered a lot silently and for centuries. The main focus of his government was on the poor and working class and he wanted to establish such a system and bring about some policies that could end the suffering of the people of Pakistan. He promised to eliminate the rule of feudal and give back dignity to the rural class and laborers of Pakistan, the dignity and respect he promised during his 1970 electoral campaign. The objective of his policy reforms was to lift the parameters, which has been followed for ages. He said that peasants have lived in poverty for centuries and it is time to lift this quo and change the policies. He claimed that the changes he made will end the problems of the rural class from the roots and will bring abrupt improvement in the economic and social status of the rural class. Bhutto's speech suggested that although he wanted an increase in production through these change policies, but the primary goal was to free the rural class especially farmers from the rule of feudalism. In his speech he said that his land developments would break the hold of feudalism and bring wealth, it would lessen unemployment, increase manufacturing, and most importantly change the relationship between property owners and lodgers (Gull, 2014).

# Achievements of Z.A Bhutto Bhuttos Foreign Policy

Bhutto was a charismatic leader of Pakistan. He believed in making Foreign policy decisions himself. He rarely involved the cabinet when making Foreign Policy decisions. After the disasters of 1971, Bhutto wanted Pakistan to have good relations with superpowers, because the disaster had done a lot of damage to the nation. Bhutto wanted to have a bilateral method of solving problems instead of multilateral. The aims of Bhutto's foreign policy were: to establish close relations with Muslim countries and to create a healthy economic order in third-world countries by creating a new economic order, and the advancement of bilateralism. He believed in creating such a foreign policy for Pakistan which will highlight the interest of Pakistan. Some of the important Foreign Policy issues were: issues in the Muslim world like Afghanistan issues, the Shimla Agreement, and recognition of Bangladesh as a separate entity (Coll, 2004).

### Shimla Agreement

The war of Bangladesh and the involvement of India made the war Indo-Pak of 1971. This war brought a number of challenges in Pakistan including the conflict with India. The defeat of Pakistan had made the citizens of Pakistan not trust any government. Bhutto's government faced a real challenge in the form of the 1971 disasters, which led to the capture of Pakistan's territory as well as thousands of civilians. This capture of territory made a lot of citizens homeless. But India in this regard wanted more from Pakistan. They wanted them to recognize Bangladesh, to have bilateral negotiations, and to give a place to live to Biharis, who were not accepted by Bengalis, they also wanted Pakistan to accept the line of policy of Kashmir and wanted to have no war agreement with them. Only then will India return Pakistan's territory and the civilians they held captive. After

this President Bhutto and Prime Minister Indira Gandhi agreed to have negotiations with each other. For this purpose, Dhar from India's side and Aziz Ahmed from Pakistan's side met and developed a schedule for the meeting of Z.A. Bhutto and Indira Gandhi. Bhutto wanted as many views as he could, so he visited several Muslim Countries to bring them on the same page with him. He also wanted the citizens of Pakistan to have his back. After a lot of struggle and deadlock between the two governments Indira Gandhi and Z.A. Bhutto finally signed an agreement. The agreement that was made between President Zulfikar Ali Bhutto and Indira Gandhi was as follows:

- Both countries will resolve their conflicts through bilateralism. They will solve their problems through peaceful negotiations and no one will act unilaterally in this regard.
- India and Pakistan shall respect each other in decision-making as well as no country will interfere in each other problems that is they will respect each other's privacy as well as sovereignty and territory.
- India and Pakistan both shall respect the position of Jammu & Kashmir. There will be no use of force in this regard, and both sides have to respect each other in this regard.
- Both sides agree on the extraction of forces from their respective territories.
- Both the head of state of India and Pakistan will meet again later, in order to discuss the future of Pak-India relations and also to discuss the issue of POW and Kashmir.
- If both countries want to have good relations they will have to regulate communications, trade, and scientific exchange between them (Gull, 2014).

# Recognition of Bangladesh

When the withdrawal of forces was over in 1972 the return of POWs was only possible if Pakistan is to recognize Bangladesh as a separate entity. The second most important issue was the

recognition of Bangladesh. There was a great debate on the recognition of the Bangladesh issue between Bhutto and his cabinet. Bhutto wanted to recognize Bangladesh so he referred to the Supreme Court and asked whether it was possible for Pakistan to recognize Bangladesh. With yes as an answer Bhutto opened his issue in the National Assembly, where Bhutto and the opposition had a great debate on the recognition of Bangladesh and The National Assembly was in favor of recognition of Bangladesh. On the second anniversary of Bhutto's government in 1973, he while addressing the citizens of Pakistan says "the recognition of Bangladesh is not yet confirmed, although Supreme Court and National Assembly has the authority of recognizing Bangladesh, but still I want your support in this regard. He further said, that the recognition of Bangladesh is an important matter and that it has to be solved and Bangladesh has to be recognized one way or the other". However, the opposition was not in favor of the recognition of Bangladesh. They argued that if Bangladesh were to be recognized it would destroy the ideological foundation of Pakistan and will bring grave consequences to the Nation. There was an intense situation on the issue of recognition of Bangladesh and the release of prisoners of War. India on the other hand killed some of the prisoners when they were trying to escape. It made India look humiliating towards the world. On the other hand, China in support of Pakistan vetoed Bangladesh and its entrance into the UN, by giving Pakistan leverage over India. It demands the release of prisoners of War if Bangladesh wants to attain its entrance back into the UN. These negotiations went on for 10 days and after a lot of struggle and hard times, an agreement was made which was known as Delhi Agreement. It requires the release of/

+f Prisoners of War, except the 195 who were charged with crimes during the war. This matter needs to be solved in another negotiation. Later on, Bangladesh decided not to punish war crimes and to release them, and slowly in 1974 every civilian that was held captive came back to Pakistan (Kiran, 2020).

## **Nuclear Program**

Another important issue was that India's Nuclear Capability was a threat to Pakistan. For this issue, Bhutto also started to work on the Nuclear Capability of Pakistan. This program of nuclear development was held top secret for a long period of time. Pakistan wanted help from Iran in this matter, but the US found out about its nuclear program in Pakistan and perceived Pakistan as a threat. So in 1976, the US warned Pakistan to not have Iran's help, if they did there would be consequences in US-PAKISTAN relations, and would stop providing military aid and economic aid to Pakistan. However, this program could not be stopped as it posed a grave threat to the security of Pakistan. Pakistan could not achieve nuclear power during Bhutto's era, but Bhutto laid the foundation of the nuclear program and it was completed in 1998 when Pakistan became a nuclear power (Qadri, 2017).

#### The Downfall of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto

Z.A Bhutto faced a lot of opposition during the 1971 elections from Wali Khan in KP, NWFP, by Baloch tribes in Balochistan. There was a lot of resistance Bhutto was facing from different factions of society. The rising problem in Balochistan was ignored by Bhutto. Sindhi Wadera on the other hand resisted the refugees of Mujahir. Bhutto facing all these factions, sided with the religious community of the society, because he could not afford their resistance as well (Sattar, 2020).

Bhutto wanted to manage this emerging crisis and launched FSF another security force and hired army staff who were retired, who did not follow laws and did not know how to do their job properly. Political assassination became very common during the times. A lot of leaders from Karachi, Lahore, and Hyderabad assassinated. Abdul Wali was also the target but he somehow escaped. Hayat Khan was murdered during his lecture in Peshawar University and Bhutto completely blamed Hayat Khan for his assassination. Bhutto in order to keep check on opposition arrested political leaders. He also ignored the pieces of advice from the seniors of his party. He thought himself to be the only person who could solve the problems of Pakistan. During that time General Tikka Khan was also close to his retirement age, and Bhutto wanted a man who was young and not senior because the army was losing trust in Bhutto. He came across the profile of Zia-ul-Haq and made him the new chief of army staff. He thought that Zia would obey him and would not go against him (Kiran, 2020).

Everyone blamed Bhutto for the fall of East Pakistan and said that another election should be held for West Pakistan and now East and West are two separate entities. At first, Bhutto was reluctant and did not want elections to be held. The Military convinced Zia to take charge and impose martial law but he did not agree. The elections of 1977 brought a lot of hurdles and irregularities. Bhutto did not let PNA win, another tactic used by Bhutto using his FSF. People were forcefully brought into elections so that the supporters from PNA couldn't find a place to vote. The opposition party blamed that the elections were fixed and demanded new elections to be held. Bhutto ignored their demand, which made the opposition more furious and angry, and started violence in Hyderabad, Karachi, and Lahore. FSF was asked to resolve the issue, but the finance budget was too low as a result FSF was badly beaten and FSF dissolved. Bhutto tried to negotiate with PNA, but PNA agreed to have fair elections, but PNA demanded the power to see the government as well. Bhutto refused and there was a deadlock between the parties (Qadri, 2017).

#### Martial Law

In the light of all this failure of election and failed dialogue between the government and PNA posed a threat to the Country and General Zia-ul-Haq, appointed by Bhutto himself and the chief of army staff enforced Martial Law in 1977 and the constitution was suspended. Zia-ul-Haq took over power in Pakistan and also arrested Zulfikar Ali Bhutto and promised to have elections in October. Bhutto was released a few days after his arrest and tried to spread hate against Zia and the

army. Zia-ul-Haq was appointed by Bhutto, but he turned against him. Suspicion about Bhutto also started among army officers and they believed that Bhutto was not worthy of having power in Pakistan. They perceived Bhutto as a threat because they thought Bhutto was the reason behind the separation of East Pakistan and West Pakistan and that he would also be the reason for the fall of Pakistan (Sattar, 2020).

## Bhutto's Execution, End of an Era

Bhutto was arrested and charged with the murder of Ahmed RazaQasuri's father. His trial was held in 1977 in Lahore High Court and after various hearings, he was proven guilty of the murder of Nawab Mehmood Ahmed Khan and was sentenced to death. He was not given any right to appeal and Zia did not allow the foreign help also. So in 1979, Bhutto was hanged to death (Qadri, 2017).

## **Analysis**

Though Zulfikar Ali Bhutto started his election campaign with huge success and support from young citizens and poor people in society after coming into power the early signs of authoritarianism started to be seen. He did a lot for poor people, laborers, the downtrodden, and tenants but he completely ignored the private sector and hence discouraged them and turned them against him. He did a lot for the educational sector but with the passage of time, his interests were seen to be given priority over people's interests. Infect the constitution of 1973 was also made in his interest. The title of Quaid-e-Awam made him arrogant and proud. He wanted to run the country on his own, even without the consent of his Party. His role during the fall of East Pakistan turned a lot of people against him, especially the army. He created his own FSF so that did not have to deal with the army. Another major reason for the downfall of Bhutto was his greed to stay in power and bring Zia-ul-haq as army chief of staff because he thought that his man could not do him any harm. Later on

Zia was the person who imposed martial law and overthrew his government. Bhutto was a passionate and very intelligent man and it was his passion and motives that led to an electoral victory in the 1970 elections, and eventually, it was his passion to resist opposition and to remain in power and his overconfidence that was the cause of his downfall (Qadri, 2017).

## Conclusion

During his power, Z.A. Bhutto had some major achievements like the constitution of 1973, reforms including land, education, health, making of medical institutes, and policies in favor of the rural class, labor, and tenants. He also initiated work on a nuclear program to make Pakistan a nuclear power which was not complete during his era. He had a strong motive of giving power to the poor class of society, thus he made enemies with other classes of society. He came as a leader of Pakistan, but eventually, he started to become a ruler. He had great success in the name of the Shimla Conference. But with the passage of time, he made a lot of enemies. He launched his own force known as FSF so that he didn't have to deal with the army, he was not fair during the 1977 elections, because he wanted to remain in power and used FSF in order to win elections. He was a key player in the fall of Eastern Pakistan and continued to make mistakes during his era as well. There was a lot of political tension in Pakistan and everyone was against Bhutto. Zia-ul-Haq, in this alarming situation, took the stand, and once a man close to Bhutto was now against him. Imposed martial law, threw Bhutto from his government, and took charge of the Nation. The provision of "roti, kapra, makaan", the slogan that caught the eyes of citizens remains unaddressed and Bhutto's era came to an end.

#### References

- Ali, M. (2001). *Readings in Foreign Policy*. Oxford University Press.
- Bhurgri, G. A. (2002). Zulfikar Ali Bhutto: the falcon of Pakistan.
- Bukhari, H. T., & Mujahid, B. A., Taimoor, R. M., &Hussain, A. S. (2020). Bhutto era amendments in the Constitution: An Analysis in the Context of Federalism. *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan.* 21(57), 1-20.pdf (pu.edu.pk)
- Coll, S. (2004). Ghost Wars: The Secret History of the CIA, Afghanistan, and Bin Laden, from the soviet invasion to September 10, 2001. Penguin Books.
- Gull, A. (2014). A Critical Study of Mujib's Six Point Programme.
- Hassan, K. (2010). *How Bhutto's fall came about. DAWN.* How Bhutto's fall came about DAWN.COM
- Kiran, N. (2020). Bhutto's cabinet: A study of its role in Formulation of Economic and Foreign policy, 1971-1977. https://www.proquest.com/scholarly-journals/z-bhuttos-cabinet-study-role-

#### formulation-

economic/docview/1767064713/se-2 https://www.proquest.com/scholarly-journals/zbhuttos-cabinet-study-role-formulationeconomic/docview/1767064713/se-2%20

- Qadri, S. D., & Khan, S. S. (2017). A Critical Assessment of Z.A. Bhutto's Policies, 1973-1977. International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences. 2222-6990.
  - A\_Critical\_Assessment\_Of\_Z.\_A\_.\_Bhutto 's\_Policies (1973–1977).pdf (hrmars.com)
- Sattar, A. (2020). *Pakistan's Foreign Policy 1947-2019: A Concise History (Fifth Edition)*. Oxford University Press.
- Syed, H. A. (1992). *The Discourse and Politics of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto*. Palgrave Macmillan UK.
- Zaidi, A. S. (2017). Special Report: The Breakup of Pakistan 1969-1971.DAWN. Special report: The Breakup of Pakistan 1969-1971 DAWN.COM
- Zaidi, A. S. (2019). Special report: The Triumph of Populism 1971-1973. DAWN. Special Report: The Triumph of Populism 1971-1973 - Pakistan - DAWN.COM